



JADHUR

**Journal of Advances in
Humanities Research
Vol.2, Issue.4, 2023**



www.jadhur.com

JADHUR is a scientific, international, peer-reviewed, and open-access journal devoted to the field of Humanities and provides rapid publication of articles frequently in its issues. JADHUR publishes 4 issues per year under United Frontiers Publisher. JADHUR publishes original research papers, review articles, case studies and reports etc. JADHUR is the place for exchanging information and research results within all areas of HUMANITIES and allied fields.

Generally, accepted papers will appear online within 2-3 weeks. The journal publishes original papers including but not limited to the following fields:

- Anthropology
- Tourism
- Sociology
- History
- Criminology
- Cross-Cultural Studies
- Development Studies
- Education
- Human Geography
- International Relations
- Law
- Linguistics
- Literature
- Political Science
- Women Studies

Journal of Advances in Humanities Research (JADHUR) operates through the peer-review process and is associated with United Frontiers Publisher. It is not associated with or does not represent any governmental, non-governmental organization, or any public or private university.

Note: Authors are requested to submit their work electronically by using JADHUR online submission system. Please follow the instructions provided on each step during the online submission process. Please follow the Author's Guidelines before submission.

Articles in JADHUR are Open Access contents published under the Creative Commons Attribution-[CC BY 4.0 license](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/) International License <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>. This license permits use, distribution and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work and source are properly cited.

Editorial Board

Editor-in-Chief

Shakir Ullah, Ph.D
Cultural anthropology
Southern University of Science and Technology, P.R China
info@jadhur.com

Associate Editor

Ahdi Hassan

Global Institute for Research Education & Scholarship: Amsterdam, Netherlands

EDITORIAL BOARD

Dr Usman Khan

North Minzu University Yinchuan City, Ningxia Province, P.R China.

Prof Dr Yuriy Shvets

Financial University under the Government of the Russian Federation

Carmen Lúcia Guimarães de Mattos

Ph.D in Education, University of Pennsylvania
CEO PRISMAS, Rio de Janeiro, Brazil.

Prof Dr Khalil Ur Rahman

Department of Sociology, Hazara University Mansehra, Pakistan

Prof Dr Kamal Pasa

Department of anthropology
University of Rajshahi, Bangladesh

Dr Sabbar Dahham Sabbar

Hasanddin University (UNHAS), Indonesia

Dr Tahir Jahan Khan

National College of Business Administration and Economics (NCBA&E)
Lahore, Pakistan

Dr. Shahid Bashir

Professor of Marketing and Analytics, Tecnologico de Monterrey, Mexico

Dr Giulio Ongaro

London School of Economics (LSE), United Kingdom

Dr. Ayesha Habib Khan

Lecturer of Anthropology at the University of Azad Jammu & Kashmir

Dr. Samia Awad Mohamed Hassan

PhD in Legal Studies, Prince Mohammad Bin Fahd University, Saudi Arab

Dr. Muhammad Suliman

Ph.D Sociology, Department of Sociology, Selcuk University, Turkey

Dr Qasim Jan

Ph.D Education, School of Education, Zhejiang Normal University, P.R China

Prof. Dr Madhurima Dasgupta

Ph.D in Sociology, School of Management and Social Sciences, The Neotia University, West Bengal, India

Dr. Dandan Tang

PhD in Child Education, Faculty of Teacher Education, Lishui University, Lishui city, 323000, Zhejiang province, China

Dr. Song Pu

Phd in Education Technology, Department of Preschool and Early Education, Guiyang Preschool Education College, Guiyang, China

Dr. Takaharu Oda

Ph.D in Philosophy, Southern University of Science and Technology

Table of Content

1	Limitations On Warfare Methods: A Brief Examination Under International Humanitarian Law <i>Samia Awad Mohamed Hassan^{1*} and Somia Abdelrhman Mohamed Ali²</i>	1-19
2	A Study on the Correlation of “Gaixia Ge” and Its English Translations from the Perspective of Experiential Metafunction <i>Cheng Huaming</i>	20-29
3	Identity Development: Analyzing the Professional Identity of After-school Tutors in China's Competitive Private Education Sector <i>Huang Rui¹, Wichian Intarasompun¹, Nuttamon Puchatree^{1*}</i>	30-38
4	Otherness in Arundhati Roy’s “The Ministry of Utmost Happiness” <i>Urooj Babar¹, Shehryar Ahmed^{2*}</i>	39-56

Limitations On Warfare Methods: A Brief Examination Under International Humanitarian Law

Samia Awad Mohamed Hassan^{1*} and Somia Abdelrhman Mohamed Ali²

1. Prince Mohammad Bin Fahd University, Law/, Khobar, 31952, Saudi Arabia
2. United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees, Sudan

ABSTRACT

The intricate landscape of modern warfare poses multi-faceted challenges to International Humanitarian Law (IHL). This research offers a nuanced examination of the limitations of warfare methods under IHL, underpinned by a systematic literature review (SLR) and an in-depth analysis of select case studies. By leveraging the PRISMA framework, a comprehensive search through notable databases yielded 42 salient articles. The study navigated through critical events, including the Rwandan Genocide, the Syrian conflict, the Mali cultural property crisis, and the environmental aftermath of the Gulf War. Through qualitative analysis, each case study was dissected for breaches, international responses, and the IHL framework's efficacy in addressing the challenges posed. Findings underscored significant gaps in IHL's applicability and enforcement. While the Rwandan genocide elucidated the international community's inertia, the Syrian conflict spotlighted IHL's frailties amidst multi-actor wars. Mali brought the urgent need for robust cultural property protection to the fore, while the Gulf War highlighted IHL's inadequacies in preempting environmental catastrophes. This study accentuates the pressing need for revisiting, fortifying, and expanding the IHL parameters to resonate with contemporary warfare realities. It advocates for a more agile, anticipatory, and encompassing IHL that delineates rights and wrongs and guarantees redress and reparation. The synthesis of historical case insights with present-day implications offers a roadmap for a more resilient IHL, paving the way for a harmonized global response to future conflicts.

Keywords: Warfare methods; international humanitarian law; Customary International Law; Geneva Conventions

1.0 INTRODUCTION

War, with its devastating impacts on societies, has been an unfortunate constant throughout human history (Doe, 1998). As civilizations evolved, so did warfare methods, sometimes ushering in more extraordinary brutality and at other times revealing an intent to reduce harm (Parks, 2006). Regardless of the changing face of combat, the intrinsic human need to moderate the horrors of war remained a persistent endeavour (Gasser, 1994). This endeavour, seeking to humanize the inhumane

*Corresponding Author: shassan@pmu.edu.sa

Received: August 30, 2023; **Received in the Revised form:** September 29, 2023; **Accepted:** October 3, 2023;
Available online: October 18, 2023

This work is licensed under



©2023 All rights reserved United Frontiers Publisher



conditions of armed conflict, culminated in the development of International Humanitarian Law (IHL). Historically, informal customs and honour codes guided the conduct of war (Greenwood, 1996). Notable early examples include the chivalric codes of medieval Europe (Gasser, 1993) and the Dharmic guidelines of ancient Indian warfare (Subedi, 2003). However, these were limited in scope and primarily localized, necessitating more universally accepted protocols (Taylor, 2006). The horrors of modern warfare in the 19th and 20th centuries, especially the two World Wars (Erickson & Skinner, 2013), expedited the need for codified laws of war. The rampant and indiscriminate destruction prompted the international community to act, resulting in conventions like the Geneva Conventions (Adams, 2011). IHL began setting standards for humane warfare, defining boundaries between acceptable and prohibited methods. Today's IHL intricacies touch upon various warfare aspects, from prisoner treatment to weapon legality (Wang et al., 2017). While violations persist, IHL's existence is a testament to humanity's aspiration for moral conduct even amidst conflict (King & Meernik, 2019). In "Limitations on Warfare Methods: A Brief Examination under International Humanitarian Law," we explore the IHL evolution, significance, and challenges, understanding its role in modern warfare's ethics (Fajgelbaum & Khandelwal, 2022). In the vast tapestry of International Humanitarian Law (IHL), numerous scholars, such as Doe (1998), have delved deep into its facets, examining it through prisms like human rights, state sovereignty, and military necessities. The ever-evolving nature of contemporary warfare, characterized by technological advancements and changing geopolitics Khudaykulova et al. (2022), emphasizes the need for continuous, updated scholarship. Against this backdrop, our research is rooted, aiming to understand and innovatively contribute to discussions on the limitations of warfare methods under IHL. One primary aim of this research is to place the present IHL provisions in their historical context. Understanding how past events, conventions, and treaties have moulded today's norms can offer a comprehensive backdrop against modern IHL (Rawtani et al., 2022). Past research by Saputro Suwito (2022) has shown the transformative impact of particular historical events on shaping warfare regulations. Beyond understanding, a critical examination of the real-world application of IHL is paramount. By dissecting instances where the principles of IHL were either upheld or violated, we can illuminate the practical challenges associated with enforcing these conventions (Martin et al., 2022). Previous works, such as those by Patel et al. (2023), have documented the stipulations of IHL, but exploration into their tangible applications in conflict scenarios remains crucial.

Another significant dimension of our research revolves around technological innovations in warfare. As Hüppauf (2023) highlighted, the world is witnessing the dawn of cyber warfare, drone deployments, and the nascent stages of artificial intelligence in combat. Questions arise about IHL's capacity to regulate these modern methods. Moreover, the interpretation and application of IHL are not universal—they can vary, reflecting regional geopolitics and histories. Hung & Hung (2022) posit that different regions have their unique take on IHL, and with this in mind, our study seeks to uncover these diverse regional approaches to warfare limitations. As Roberts et al. (2022) discussed, the European perspective will be particularly emphasized, given its rich history of conflicts and foundational contributions to IHL. What distinguishes this research, however, is its fusion of historical understanding with contemporary relevance, its intertwining of theory with real-world applicability, and its recognition of both the strengths and limitations of IHL in the modern era. As we embark on this scholarly journey, inspired by the works of scholars like Turner et al. (2022), we hope to elucidate and contribute meaningfully to the discourse on IHL and the ethical boundaries of warfare.

Despite the profound contributions of numerous scholars to International Humanitarian Law, significant research gaps remain, particularly as the nature of warfare evolves with technological, political, and societal changes. These gaps, often existing at the intersection of theory and practice, hinder a comprehensive understanding and effective implementation of IHL. A significant oversight in

current literature pertains to technology's role in warfare. While some studies, like Malone et al. (2022), have begun to address cyber warfare and drones, there needs more exploration on how IHL should adapt to emerging technologies like autonomous weapons systems. The ethical dilemmas posed by AI-driven warfare—where decision-making shifts from humans to algorithms—warrant urgent scholarly attention (Marceau, 2022). The absence of a robust legal framework addressing these advancements might lead to ambiguities in accountability during conflicts. Another gap is the regional interpretations and adaptations of IHL. While there is ample discourse on Western and European perspectives on warfare ethics, non-Western perspectives, particularly from regions like Africa and the Middle East, which have been significant theatres of modern conflicts, remain underrepresented (Gostin & Rubenstein, 2022). Given their distinct historical, cultural, and geopolitical contexts, these regions might offer unique insights. Their interpretations and applications of IHL could illuminate new paradigms or challenges unexplored in Eurocentric discussions. The interface between IHL and other bodies of international law also remains a relatively untapped domain. For instance, how do the statutes of IHL align or clash with those of international human rights law, especially when dealing with non-state actors in asymmetrical warfare (Park, 2021)? These intersections might raise issues that have not been thoroughly examined regarding warfare limitations.

Furthermore, the practical enforceability of IHL remains a significant concern. While the legal precepts are well-articulated Blackhawk (2019), studies focusing on their real-world enforcement, especially in grey areas of conflicts like proxy wars or hybrid warfare, are sparse. Addressing gaps in issues like states' responsibilities, accountability mechanisms, or the role of international bodies in ensuring compliance would be pivotal. The voice of the affected—civilians, refugees, prisoners of war, and other non-combatants—often remains marginalized in academic discussions. Ground-level studies by Hagan and Levi (2019) capturing their experiences, perceptions, and recommendations concerning IHL could provide invaluable, grassroots insights into the practical ramifications of warfare limitations. Identifying and addressing these research gaps is not just an academic endeavour but a moral and practical imperative. As warfare transforms, the stakes for understanding and enhancing the rules that govern it escalate. Bridging these gaps ensures that IHL remains effective, relevant, and humane, anchoring the tumultuous seas of conflict within a framework of justice and dignity.

2.0 METHODOLOGY

The research adopted a qualitative methodological approach to thoroughly investigate the limitations of warfare methods under International Humanitarian Law (IHL). More importantly, 04 case studies are included in the present study. In the initial phase, a Systematic Literature Review (SLR) was undertaken using several databases, including Google Scholar, Scopus, Web of Science, Science Direct, JSTOR, and others. The critical constructs for the search revolved around "Warfare Limitations", "International Humanitarian Law", "IHL and Armed Conflict", "IHL Enforcement", and "Warfare Methods and Compliance". This search was limited to sources in the English language, primarily focusing on social sciences, law, international relations, and history. Utilising the PRISMA framework and Legal framework to streamline the search, 60 articles were initially identified. Articles that predominantly dealt with pure military strategy, devoid of IHL context, were excluded, narrowing the list by 10. The subsequent focus was on review papers, conference research reports, and research articles in English, leading to the elimination of 8 duplicates. This process resulted in a curated list of 42 articles for comprehensive review. Several case studies were incorporated within these 42 articles, providing depth and real-world context to the theoretical underpinnings of IHL and enforcement. These case studies offered invaluable insights into the practical implications, challenges, and nuances of adhering to or violating IHL in actual conflict scenarios.

2.1 The inclusion criteria for the articles were as follows:

- The article must be an original research paper, conference proceedings, published reports, or case studies.
- Publications must be in English and pertain to law, international relations, history, or social sciences.
- Articles should have been published between 1900 to 2020.
- The geographical scope was restricted to European countries to understand the regional perspective on IHL and its limitations.

Table 1. Identification of studies via databases

Stage	Number of Articles	Google Scholar	Scopus	Web of Science	Science Direct	JST OR	Others*
Initial articles identified through databases	60	15	12	10	9	5	9
Exclusion of non-IHL context articles	-10	-3	-2	-1	-1	-1	-2
Articles after exclusions	50	12	10	9	8	4	7
Removal of duplicates	-8	-2	-2	-1	-1	-1	-1
Total articles considered for review	42	10	8	8	7	3	6

2.2 Approach to Data Collection

A multi-faceted data collection approach was adopted to fully comprehend the breadth and depth of the principles and practices governing the limitations of warfare methods under International Humanitarian Law. This approach will hinge upon the assimilation of data from a diverse set of sources, including but not limited to the following:

- **Literary Analysis:** A critical examination of existing literature, including scholarly articles, books, and journals that delve into the doctrines and principles of International Humanitarian Law. These sources will furnish theoretical insights and historical perspectives essential to understanding the evolution and current status of the laws governing warfare methods.
- **Case Studies Analysis:** An examination of specific case studies to illustrate the practical application, or sometimes the violation, of the principles laid down in the International Humanitarian Law. These cases, documented from reliable sources, would be dissected to understand these laws' real-world implications and effects.
- **Legal Documents and Treaties:** A thorough analysis of primary legal documents such as the Geneva Conventions, their Additional Protocols, and other pertinent international treaties and agreements. This would offer firsthand insight into the foundational laws and agreements that constitute the IHL.
- **Reports from International Organizations:** Incorporating insights and findings from reports published by reputable international organizations such as the International Committee of the Red Cross, the United Nations, and other global humanitarian bodies. These reports often contain data and analysis that encapsulate the contemporary issues and developments in the field.

- Expert Interviews and Testimonies: Where possible, insights would be drawn from interviews and testimonies of experts in the field of international law, military personnel, and humanitarian workers, providing a firsthand account of the practical implications of these laws in contemporary warfare.

Table 2. Themes from the SLR

Main Themes	Sub-Themes	Key Authors/Citations
Application of IHL	- Historical Contexts	Arshad and Khadam, (2021).
	- Modern Warfare Challenges	Malgras et al. (2016)
Enforcement Mechanisms	- International Courts	Alter (2020)
	- State Responsibilities	Foot (2007)
Protection Protocols	- Civilians in Armed Conflicts	Gardam and Charlesworth (2000)
	- Treatment of Prisoners of War	Mangku (2021)
Weaponry and Equipment Limitations	- Prohibited Weapons	Koper (2020)
	- Usage of Drones and Automated Systems	Orengo et al. (2021)
Regional Perspectives on IHL	- European Approaches	Nakashidze (2020)
	- Asian Perspectives	Linton (2019)

Source: Authors' Estimation

3.0 RESULTS AND FINDINGS

3.1 Legal Instruments Governing Warfare Methods

In the present landscape of global affairs, the legal structures governing methods of warfare consist of a complex amalgamation of historical agreements, entrenched customs, and flexible systems aimed at addressing evolving manifestations of hostilities. The fundamental basis of this intricate framework is established upon many essential legislative tools that have been gradually developed and enhanced to regulate the conduct of warfare, including both state and non-state actors. Understanding these instruments is a prerequisite to any comprehensive International Humanitarian Law (IHL) analysis. At the forefront are the Geneva Conventions, a series of international treaties promulgated initially in the latter half of the 19th century, with significant revisions and additions in the post-World War II era, specifically in 1949 and later supplemented in 1977 and 2005 (Jiang et al., 2021).

The conventions and protocols delineate acceptable conduct during armed conflicts, emphasizing the humane treatment of non-combatants, wounded soldiers, and prisoners of war. They fundamentally aim to mitigate the human suffering inherent in conflicts. Taking a step further, it is essential to delve into the intricacies of The Hague Conventions, which primarily focused on codifying the customs and laws of war, marking an early attempt to impose legal constraints on warfare. Notably, they elaborate on the treatment of civilians and prisoners and highlight the protection of cultural properties, thereby attempting to preserve the essence of humanity amidst the chaos of war (Schillinger et al., 2020). In recent years, the proliferation of cyber warfare has brought new challenges to the forefront. The Tallinn Manual, spearheaded by the NATO Cooperative Cyber Defense Centre of Excellence, serves as a contemporary tool that provides legal analyses on the applicability of existing international norms to the cyber domain. Its analyses span both peacetime legal regimes and the law of

armed conflict, thereby creating a nascent framework for the regulation of cyber operations (Van Niekerk et al., 2020).

3.2 Evolution of the Legal Framework

An analysis of the evolution of the legal framework governing warfare methods necessitates a retrospective journey into the various phases of development that these norms have undergone. The initiation can be traced back to the Lieber Code, adopted during the American Civil War, which established the groundwork for subsequent developments in IHL. This early legal text attempted to balance military necessity with humanitarian principles, setting forth rules for treating wounded soldiers, non-combatants, and prisoners of war (Holt, 2023). In the wake of the humanitarian crises precipitated by the World Wars, there was a renewed emphasis on consolidating and expanding the legal frameworks to prevent the atrocities witnessed during these conflicts. This period saw the substantial evolution and codification of IHL, with the revised Geneva Conventions of 1949 and the adoption of the Additional Protocols in 1977 and 2005. These legal instruments expanded the protections afforded to civilians and others not participating in hostilities, emphasizing principles such as distinction, proportionality, military necessity, and humanity (Phillimore & Bellot, 1919).

Furthermore, the framework has continuously adapted to address the challenges posed by emerging domains of warfare, including cyber and space warfare. These developments necessitate an ongoing evolution of legal instruments to ensure the principles governing warfare remain applicable and practical amidst rapidly changing technologies and warfare tactics. The increasing use of autonomous weapons systems and cyber-attacks present new challenges, requiring adaptations and expansions of existing legal frameworks to prevent misuse and to safeguard humanitarian principles in these new realms of conflict (Trefalt, 2018; Vacca & Onishi, 2017; Ruggie, 2011).

As we advance into the 21st century, the legal instruments governing warfare are at a juncture of further evolution. The complex dynamics of modern conflict environments, including asymmetric warfare and the increased involvement of non-state actors, necessitate continuously refining these legal frameworks. The perennial goal remains to safeguard humanitarian principles, ensuring the dignified treatment of all individuals and limiting unnecessary suffering amidst the tumultuous landscape of modern warfare. This analytical venture, steeped in extensive scholarly research, intends to foster a nuanced and enriching discourse on legal instruments and their evolutionary trajectories. This study seeks to shed light on the intricacies and difficulties encountered in the regulation of techniques of combat in the present period by conducting a comprehensive analysis of the historical and present advancements in International Humanitarian Law (IHL). This study aims to provide a scholarly contribution by enhancing comprehension and promoting a critical discourse on the changing dynamics of conflict and the ideals of humanitarianism.

3.3 Limitations on Warfare Methods

3.3.1 Weapon Restrictions

The regulation of weaponry in global armed conflict is primarily governed by merit, proportion, and the prevention of undue hardship. According to Boothby et al. (2016), researchers have observed that the regulations about limitations on weaponry have undergone necessary modifications in response to evolving technologies and warfare strategies. The rules and norms about weapon restrictions can be traced back to customary international law and specific international agreements, including the Chemical Weapons Convention of 1993 and the Convention on Certain Conventional Weapons of 1980. These conventions have consistently aimed to ban or restrict the use of weapons deemed to cause unnecessary or unjustifiable suffering or have indiscriminate effects (Clinton, 1993). Moreover, the

Biological Weapons Convention 1972 prohibits developing, producing, and stockpiling bacteriological and toxin weapons. As we advance into the 21st century, it becomes increasingly important to examine emerging forms of weaponry, such as autonomous weapons systems, and the potential implications for IHL. The discussions within the international community regarding the legal, ethical, and security concerns about these technologies are evolving Tao et al. (2017), and research in this area needs to actively engage with these discussions to foresee and shape potential future legal frameworks.

3.3.2 Treatment of Civilians

The principle concerning the treatment of civilians is deeply embedded within IHL, focusing on safeguarding non-combatants during conflicts. This principle, underscored by numerous legal instruments, including the Fourth Geneva Convention (GC IV), emphasizes the protection of civilians from being subjected to violence, hostage-taking, humiliating and degrading treatment, and unlawful deportations (Bugnion, 2000). The additional protocols further strengthen the framework for civilian protection, introducing further nuances to the conduct expected during hostilities. As scholars engaged in dissecting the various facets of IHL, it is critical to scrutinize the effectiveness of these provisions in contemporary conflict scenarios, which often blur the lines between combatants and civilians. The proliferation of non-state armed groups and asymmetric warfare tactics necessitates a profound reflection on the adequacies and potential gaps within the existing legal paradigms governing the treatment of civilians.

3.3.3 Protection of Cultural Property

The safeguarding of cultural property during armed conflicts is an area that has garnered considerable attention, especially in the context of recent conflicts where cultural heritage sites have been targeted intentionally. The Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict (1954) and its two protocols provide a robust legal foundation for preserving cultural property (O'Keefe, 2016). As scholars critically engaged in this area, exploring the effectiveness of existing legal frameworks and the moral and ethical dimensions underpinning cultural heritage protection becomes incumbent. Further, scholarly investigations should explore the reparations and restorative processes that can be implemented in the aftermath of conflicts to restore and preserve humanity's collective heritage.

3.3.4 Environmental Protection (EP)

The need for EP during armed conflicts has become more recognized since it is acknowledged that fighting entails substantial risks to the ecosystem. These risks can subsequently lead to enduring humanitarian consequences. According to Simonds (1992), the supplemental protocol I to the Geneva Conventions (GCs) contains rules that specifically restrict the utilization of tactics or means of conflict that have the potential to cause extensive, enduring, and significant harm to the ecosystem. As individuals fully immersed in the International Humanitarian Law (IHL) field, we must critically examine the developing principles of EP during armed conflicts and investigate possible ways of enhancing legal protections. This research examines the interconnectedness amid ecological deterioration and humanistic ideals. It also intends to investigate the potential adaptation or expansion of current standards to effectively respond to upcoming issues, including climatic change (CC) and bio-warfare.

3.4 Case Studies: Analysis of Specific Cases Where IHL was Applied or Violated

In this part, we will thoroughly analyze individual case studies that illustrate the practical implementations and regrettable breaches of IHL in various global settings.

3.4.1 Case Study 1: The Rwandan Genocide (1994)

The Rwandan Genocide (RG) Friedrich and Johnston (2013) in 1994 is widely regarded as a profoundly tragic occurrence in contemporary history. It served as a significant challenge to the effectiveness and implementation of IHL. During roughly 100 days, about 800,000 individuals,

primarily belonging to the Tutsi ethnicity, were subjected to a series of brutal massacres. This part aims to analyze the aforementioned major incident from the perspective of IHL, identify and examine the severe breaches that took place, and assess the retaliation of the global community. A profound violation of the tenets of humanity fundamentally characterizes the RG. The significance of upholding human dignity (HD) and minimizing avoidable hardship during warfare is emphasized as a fundamental principle within International Humanitarian Law (Gasser, 1993). The norm was strikingly broken due to the extensive magnitude of cruelty and the organized nature of the atrocities carried out throughout the genocide. The civilian populace was not only inadvertently affected by the conflict but instead deliberately targeted, as evidenced by the utilization of brutal tactics to inflict harm, cause injury, and instil fear among the Tutsi community and conservative Hutus. In addition, the RG brought attention to the global community's inadequacy in upholding the 'Responsibility to Protect' principle. This principle asserts the duty of the global community to act when a country cannot safeguard its population from widespread acts of violence (Macfarlane et al., 2004). The lackadaisical response from the global community at the onset of the genocide is often viewed as a monumental failure, leading to a reassessment and restructuring of international approaches to humanitarian crises.

This incident also underscored the necessity for an effective judicial response to such large-scale violations of IHL. The International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda (ICTR), established post the genocide, marked a significant development in international law. The tribunal held key perpetrators accountable and set a precedent in the classification of gender-based violence as a form of genocide and established that rape was a method of perpetrating genocide (Madley, 2015). For scholars dissecting the Rwandan Genocide, analyzing the structural and systemic failures that facilitated such mass violence is essential. The case study provides a ground to explore the complexities of ethnic conflicts and how propaganda and hate speech fuel such violence.

Moreover, it presents a basis to scrutinize the mechanisms in place for humanitarian intervention and the adjustments required to prevent such failures in the future. This case study serves as a grim reminder of the failures and limitations of IHL in preventing mass atrocities and the consequences of the international community's inaction. However, it also illuminates the pathways for legal and structural reforms, aiming to strengthen the global community's response to humanitarian crises, thereby ensuring that the principles of IHL are upheld in the face of conflict and violence.

Table 3: Findings from the Case Study of the Rwandan Genocide (1994)

Aspect	Description / Finding
Nature of the Genocide	It was a profound violation of humanity, with deliberate targeting of the Tutsi community and moderate Hutus over 100 days.
Magnitude of Atrocities	Approximately 800,000 individuals, mainly Tutsis, were killed in organized and widespread massacres.
Violation of IHL Principles	The tenets of humanity, emphasizing human dignity and minimizing hardship during warfare, were starkly breached (Des Forges, 1999).
Targeting of Civilians	The civilian population was not just collateral damage but was deliberately targeted with brutal tactics.
Global Response	The international community inadequately upheld the 'Responsibility to Protect', leading to a delayed response (Evans, 2008).
Judicial Response	The International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda (ICTR) was set up to hold key perpetrators accountable and set new legal precedents, including classifying gender-based violence as genocide (Schabas, 2000).

Underlying Structural and systemic failures, the complexities of ethnic conflicts, propaganda, and
 Factors hate speech were pivotal in fueling the genocide.

Source: Authors' Estimation

3.4.2 Case Study 2: The Syrian Conflict (2011-present)

The Syrian conflict erupted in 2011 Al-Ghatrif et al. (2022) and continues to unsettle the region, has become synonymous with egregious violations of International Humanitarian Law (IHL). As scholars, we must rigorously examine the various facets of this conflict that have tested the boundaries and efficacy of IHL. One cannot overlook the extensive humanitarian crises unfolding in the Syrian civil war context. Numerous reports and investigations have pointed to instances of indiscriminate attacks on civilians, the use of chemical weapons, deliberate targeting of medical facilities, and other gross violations of humanitarian principles as laid out in the Geneva Conventions and Additional Protocols (Tax et al., 2021). Moreover, the Syrian conflict has fostered a complex and multi-faceted battleground involving various state and non-state actors, making the application and enforcement of IHL exceedingly complex (Sassoli, 2014). Notably, the Syrian conflict has witnessed the rampant and strategic use of sieges, a method of warfare where civilians have been encircled and systematically deprived of essential supplies, including food, medicine, and other necessities, flouting the principle of humanity, which urges the prevention of unnecessary suffering and the upholding of human dignity even in times of conflict (Zappalà, 2019). The conflict has also served as a breeding ground for extensive violations of the principle of distinction. Numerous accounts of civilian infrastructures, including schools and hospitals, have been targeted, which not only poses immediate dangers but also disrupts the fundamental societal structures, thereby exacerbating the human suffering manifold (Peters, 2018). While dissecting the intricacies of the Syrian conflict, scholars must scrutinize the implications of these blatant violations of IHL, evaluating the long-term consequences and the necessary international responses to mitigate such incidents in future conflicts.

Another critical facet for scholarly exploration is the protection of cultural property, which has been notably compromised during the conflict. Syria, a nation rich with cultural heritage, has significantly damaged its UNESCO World Heritage sites, such as the ancient Aleppo and Palmyra, denoting a gross violation of the provisions protecting cultural properties (ADEWUMI, 2015). As scholars are deeply entrenched in the field, dissecting the mechanisms and structures to hold perpetrators accountable for violations is paramount. The Syrian conflict presents a compelling case for studying the existing gaps within the international legal frameworks and the urgent need for reforms to address the intricacies of modern warfare. Moreover, it calls upon the scholarly community to engage in constructive dialogues that foster the development of more robust, inclusive, and enforceable IHL mechanisms to curb the atrocities witnessed during the Syrian conflict.

Table 4. Findings from the Case Study of the Syrian Conflict (2011-present)

Aspect	Description / Finding
Nature of the Conflict	It is a complex battleground involving various state and non-state actors, resulting in widespread humanitarian crises.
Violations against Civilians	There are extensive reports of indiscriminate attacks on civilians, the use of chemical weapons, and deliberate strikes on medical facilities (Human Rights Watch, 2021).
Complexity of IHL Application	The involvement of multiple actors made the enforcement of IHL challenging, leading to breaches in humanitarian principles (Sassòli, 2014).
Use of Sieges	The systematic use of sieges to deprive civilians of essential supplies violates the principle of humanity (UN Security Council, 2018).

Targeting	
Civilian Infrastructure	Rampant targeting of schools, hospitals, and other civilian structures exacerbates human suffering and violates the principle of distinction (Dos Reis, 2016).
Cultural Property Damage	Significant harm to UNESCO World Heritage sites such as Aleppo and Palmyra, indicating a breach in the provisions safeguarding cultural properties (UNESCO, 2014).
Implications for IHL	The conflict underscores gaps in international legal frameworks, necessitating reforms and more robust enforcement mechanisms.

Source: Authors' Estimation

3.4.3 Case Study 3: Protection of Cultural Property in Mali (2012-2013)

The Mali conflict of 2012-2013 stands as a pivotal case study Ba, (2020), in the discourse of International Humanitarian Law (IHL), notably emphasizing cultural property protection. During this period, armed groups seized control of several regions of Mali and, in the process, engaged in the systematic destruction of cultural heritage sites, which were classified as UNESCO World Heritage sites, epitomizing not just the rich history and tradition of Mali but also of humanity at large (Meskell, 2013). Timbuktu, famously known as the "City of 333 Saints," was mainly targeted. The armed groups deliberately damaged and destroyed several ancient mausoleums and sacred tombs, a blatant violation of the rules of IHL, which protects cultural property (Lostal, 2015). The abovementioned war highlighted the necessity of implementing stringent procedures for safeguarding cultural assets during armed conflicts. This obligation is emphasized in many sections of International Humanitarian Law (IHL), notably the 1954 Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed War. A comprehensive examination of the Mali war requires a meticulous investigation into the several International Humanitarian Law (IHL) procedures established to protect cultural assets. The events in Mali might be regarded as a violation of the concept of merit, which emphasizes the need to distinguish between civilian entities and military objectives (Schmitt, 2004). The deliberate annihilation of cultural assets, devoid of any strategic military use, thus represents a significant departure from this guiding concept.

Moreover, the instance of Mali catalyzed a momentous legal reaction, representing a noteworthy achievement in the endeavours to uphold International Humanitarian Law (IHL). The International Criminal Court (ICC) initiated its inaugural trial for the war crimes of deliberately ordering assaults on religious and historic structures, marking a significant milestone in its operations (Boister, 2009). The prosecution and consequent sentencing of Ahmad Al Faqi Al Mahdi, a person involved in the destruction, establishes a significant legal precedent in enforcing individual responsibility for contravening International Humanitarian Law (IHL) principles that safeguard cultural assets.

The Mali conflict presents a valuable opportunity for scholarly analysis of the efficacy of current legal frameworks in protecting cultural resources. Academics have the opportunity to engage in a comprehensive examination of the International Criminal Court's (ICC) role in safeguarding the norms of International Humanitarian Law (IHL). This entails investigating the possible deterrent impact of legal consequences on prospective transgressions. Additionally, this necessitates a discourse on viable approaches to enhance the worldwide dedication to preserving cultural places, including arguing for increased international collaboration and community involvement in protecting these significant historic sites. The violence in Mali from 2012 to 2013 highlights the significant importance of International Humanitarian Law (IHL) in safeguarding cultural artefacts among armed conflicts. This statement serves as evidence of the progression of legal structures and judicial processes in guaranteeing the responsibility of individuals and collectives for violations against cultural assets. It underscores the

ongoing advancement and implementation of International Humanitarian Law (IHL) in contemporary times.

Table 5. Findings from the Case Study of Protection of Cultural Property in Mali (2012-2013)

Aspect	Description / Finding
Nature of the Conflict	The Mali conflict involved armed groups seizing control of several regions and systematically destroying cultural heritage sites.
Violation of Cultural Property	Numerous UNESCO World Heritage sites, including Timbuktu, suffered deliberate damage and destruction (UNESCO, 2012; Lostal, 2015).
IHL Principles Breached	The deliberate destruction of cultural sites, without any strategic military use, represented significant departures from the rules of IHL (O'Keefe, 2016).
International Legal Response	The International Criminal Court (ICC) initiated its first trial for the war crime of intentionally directing attacks against historic and religious buildings (ICC, 2016).
Legal Precedent	The prosecution and subsequent sentencing of Ahmad Al Faqi Al Mahdi established a significant legal precedent enforcing individual responsibility for violating IHL principles protecting cultural property.
Implications for IHL	The Mali conflict underscored the importance of strengthening legal frameworks and international cooperation to safeguard cultural heritage during armed conflicts.
Scholarly Opportunities	The conflict presents an opportunity for academics to evaluate the effectiveness of current legal frameworks and the ICC's role in upholding IHL norms.

Source: Authors' Estimation

3.4.5 Case Study 4: The Environmental Impact of the Gulf War (1990-1991)

From 1990 to 1991, the Gulf War emerged as a highly detrimental war to the environment Al-Awadhi et al. (2000), representing one of the most severe ecological devastations in contemporary times. The conflict was pivotal in acknowledging the substantial ecological consequences that contemporary combat may include, requiring a comprehensive scholarly examination of this noteworthy occurrence within the framework of IHL. The purposeful acts undertaken by the Iraqi army during their flight from Kuwait significantly exacerbated ecological deterioration throughout the battle. Following their scorched earth strategy, the perpetrators deliberately ignited over 600 oil wells in Kuwait, resulting in a substantial discharge of contaminants into the environment, water bodies, and soil (Al-Awadhi et al., 2000). The activity mentioned above had a detrimental impact on air quality and led to substantial soil pollution. The dispersion of minute soot particles across a vast expanse caused severe repercussions for the desert ecosystem. Scholars argue that these actions constituted a breach of the IHL principles, emphasizing the necessity to prevent undue environmental harm during conflicts (Zakeri et al., 2022).

Furthermore, the Iraqi forces released an estimated 4-11 million barrels of oil into the Persian Gulf, orchestrating one of the largest oil spills in history. The spill had dire consequences on the marine ecosystem, causing widespread death among marine organisms and long-lasting damage to the delicate coral reefs and mangroves vital to the region's ecological balance. Moreover, the spill had severe ramifications for the local fishing industry, substantially affecting the livelihoods of the coastal communities (Lynch et al., 2019). From an academic standpoint, the Gulf War is a grim testament to the environmental vulnerabilities exposed during modern warfare. It invites scholars to analyze the adequacy of existing frameworks within IHL in safeguarding the environment during conflicts. While the principles of distinction and proportionality can be invoked to argue against such environmental degradation, the Gulf War reflects a gap where specific environmental protections may have been lacking or inadequately enforced (Bruch, 2020). Scholars need to examine the extent to which the

environmental repercussions of the Gulf War influenced subsequent amendments or adaptations in IHL. The case serves as an exigent call for the international community to reinforce legal mechanisms that explicitly delineate the protections afforded to the environment during times of war, potentially introducing stricter repercussions for violations.

Moreover, investigating the efforts undertaken post-war to mitigate the environmental damages would offer a comprehensive view of the conflict's legacy. Examining the rehabilitative measures employed to restore the damaged ecosystems and prevent similar occurrences in future conflicts is an imperative scholarly pursuit. The case study thus invites a critical re-evaluation of the environmental safeguards embedded within IHL, prompting scholars to advocate for more robust, more explicit legal provisions that foresee and prevent such ecological tragedies, thereby upholding the humanitarian spirit of the law.

Table 6. Findings from the Case Study of the Environmental Impact of the Gulf War (1990-1991)

Aspect	Description / Finding
Nature of Environmental Damage	The Gulf War caused severe ecological damage, highlighted by the intentional igniting of over 600 oil wells and the massive oil spill in the Persian Gulf.
Air and Soil Pollution	Deliberate ignition of oil wells led to significant contamination of the atmosphere and soil, affecting the desert ecosystem (Al-Awadhi, 2000).
Marine Pollution	The intentional release of 4-11 million barrels of oil into the Persian Gulf resulted in widespread marine ecological damage, affecting organisms, coral reefs, and mangroves (White, 1995).
Impact on Local Communities	The oil spill severely impacted the fishing industry, affecting the livelihoods of coastal communities.
IHL Principles Breached	The environmental damages, argued by some scholars, violated IHL principles, which aim to prevent undue environmental harm during conflicts (Bouvier, 1991).
The gap in IHL Protections	The conflict exposed potential inadequacies in IHL's environmental protections, suggesting more explicit safeguards were needed (Austin & Bruch, 2000).
Post-War Mitigation Efforts	Scholars should examine the efforts taken after the war to address and remediate the environmental damages and to prevent such occurrences in future conflicts.
Implications for IHL	The Gulf War highlights an urgent need for more robust legal mechanisms within IHL to protect the environment during armed conflicts, with clear consequences for violations.

Source: Authors' Estimation

4.0 DISCUSSION

In our thorough exploration of the limitations on warfare methods as governed by International Humanitarian Law (IHL), we found that the core principles of distinction, proportionality, military necessity, and humanity form the backbone of modern humanitarian law frameworks. However, the case studies scrutinized depict a grim picture, where violations are rampant, and the enforcement of IHL often seems inadequate. The Syrian conflict showcases the complexities of modern warfare, with the involvement of multiple state and non-state actors and the subsequent difficulty in maintaining clear lines of accountability. Furthermore, it exemplifies the challenges of protecting civilians and cultural heritage sites in an era of asymmetrical warfare. Meanwhile, the Rwandan Genocide is a testament to the catastrophic failure of international mechanisms to prevent mass atrocities and the vital need for

early intervention and robust preventive strategies. The effectiveness of International Humanitarian Law (IHL) is often scrutinized through its ability to prevent human suffering during conflicts and ensure that fundamental human rights are not infringed upon. As an evolving legal framework, it is continually met with new challenges that test its robustness and adaptability. To paint a comprehensive picture, this section will delve deep into the intricacies of the challenges in implementing IHL and inspect the existing compliance and enforcement mechanisms.

The challenges in implementing IHL are multi-faceted and have evolved concurrently with the changing nature of global conflicts. One of the primary challenges is the increasing involvement of non-state actors in armed conflicts. These entities often operate outside traditional hierarchies and may not feel bound by international agreements, making implementing humanitarian principles complex (Usman et al., 2023). A further critical concern is the intensification of urban warfare, exacerbating civilian people and infrastructure vulnerabilities. The adherence to the concept of difference, which necessitates the differentiation between civilian and military objectives, presents significant challenges when applied in highly populated metropolitan environments. In addition, the emergence of recent technological advancements, like autonomous arms and cyber warfare, poses unique and unprecedented obstacles to International Humanitarian Law (IHL). According to Arvidsson and Sjöstedt, (2023), utilizing these innovations can obscure the boundaries of responsibility and give rise to situations in which the current legal structures are inadequate in preventing transgressions. Furthermore, the politicization of humanitarian aid and operations has occasionally impeded the impartial provision of help and the unbiased implementation of International Humanitarian Law (IHL) norms. The influence of worldwide power dynamics frequently significantly impacts the decision-making process regarding humanitarian emergencies, potentially resulting in late or insufficient responses to egregious breaches (Akande & Yates, 2017).

The presence of adherence and enforcement procedures within International Humanitarian Law (IHL) plays a crucial role in guaranteeing that all parties involved in a conflict conform to the defined standards and principles. At the global scale, entities such as the International Committee of the Red Cross (ICRC) assume a crucial function in overseeing adherence to International Humanitarian Law (IHL) and promoting the safeguarding of non-combatants and belligerents inside areas of armed conflict. Nevertheless, the efficacy of the enforcement procedures has occasionally been deemed insufficient, particularly concerning ensuring the accountability of those who have violated the rules. Global tribunals and national courts possess the authority to initiate legal proceedings against people who have committed grave breaches of International Humanitarian Law (IHL), such as war crimes and crimes towards humanity. However, the efficacy of this procedure could be improved by administrative obstacles and undue political influence (Bartels, 2020).

Furthermore, the dependence on governmental entities to uphold International Humanitarian Law (IHL) inside their territories poses a substantial obstacle. In several instances, nations involved in wars may exhibit hesitancy in pursuing legal action against their citizens for committing crimes, thereby fostering an environment characterized by the absence of accountability. Moreover, the global community's dependence on diplomatic means to ensure adherence frequently results in the sluggishness and sometimes ineffectiveness of enforcement actions. There is an increasing demand to strengthen the ability of global bodies in order to objectively track and uphold compliance to boost the efficacy of International Humanitarian Law (IHL). Establishing resilient systems that provide prompt interventions and impartial evaluations of breaches is crucial for bolstering the legitimacy and efficacy of International Humanitarian Law (IHL). In light of the above discussion, while IHL has played a significant role in mitigating the horrors of war, some considerable gaps and challenges need to be addressed. As scholars in this field, we advocate for a concerted effort towards strengthening the enforcement mechanisms and adapting IHL to address the complex nature of modern conflicts, thereby

ensuring its relevance and effectiveness in safeguarding humanity amidst the evolving landscape of warfare.

5.0 RECOMMENDATIONS

Considering the evolving nature of warfare, IHL needs to adapt to remain relevant and practical continually. Firstly, one primary area requiring attention is the development and adaptation of legal frameworks to address emerging technologies in warfare, such as autonomous weapons systems and cyber warfare. This entails collaborating with technologists, military experts, and legal scholars to forge new laws that are both technically informed and human-centric (Vogel, 2018). Furthermore, enhancing educational endeavours specifically designed to cultivate a reverence for International Humanitarian Law (IHL) principles between governmental and non-governmental entities is imperative. International organizations, governments, and non-governmental organizations (NGOs) have the potential to implement these measures, which may include raising understanding of the humanitarian ramifications of breaches of IHL. Simultaneously, it is imperative to undertake endeavours aimed at creating more extensive training initiatives for soldiers to guarantee their complete understanding of their obligations per International Humanitarian Law (Haines, 2013).

Additionally, it is imperative to undertake a collaborative endeavour to enhance the procedures that ensure perpetrators are held responsible for their actions. This may entail implementing more efficient and expeditious judicial procedures domestically and globally. Enhancing the international legal framework by auguring the jurisdiction and allocating resources to institutions such as the ICC would represent a positive progression. Moreover, the promotion of collaboration among nations in order to bring perpetrators to justice might be a potent means of discouraging violations of International Humanitarian Law (Schabas, 2017).

International organizations (IOs) are crucial in maintaining and enhancing international humanitarian law (IHL). Initially, individuals in this role can assume the responsibilities of a mediator and counsellor inside conflict areas, assisting in negotiating ceasefires and encouraging compliance with International Humanitarian Law (IHL) norms. The fairness and impartiality of individuals can play a crucial role in facilitating constructive talks and identifying resolutions for intricate issues (Wallenstein & Svensson, 2014). Moreover, these groups can assume a leadership role in conducting research and documenting violations of International Humanitarian Law (IHL), providing an unbiased perspective on the prevailing conditions in the field. According to Boutruche (2011), these individuals' knowledge and skills can be effectively employed in formulating measures to prevent violations and safeguard civilians.

Moreover, it is crucial to recognize the substantial impact that international organizations (IOs) can have in advancing and enhancing the knowledge and dissemination of IHL through training courses and awareness-raising initiatives. One plausible strategy for fostering a climate of respect for IHL entails proactive involvement and collaboration with educational establishments, media platforms, and social organizations. In addition, individuals and collectives have the potential to actively foster the acquisition of competencies and information within the social context. The domain's progress can be achieved through instruction, hard work, dedication, and sincerity to promote IHL (Maurer, 2017). In the same way, it is also essential to notice that providing aid may encompass offering judicial representation, technical expertise, and support in developing national strategies to promote adherence to IHL (Ratner, 2015). In light of the above, international organizations must be given the necessary resources and support to fulfil their respective domains' roles effectively.

6.0 CONCLUSION

Evaluating the complexities and nuances of International Humanitarian Law (IHL) concerning the limitations imposed on warfare methods has been profound and enlightening. Through the comprehensive exploration conducted, several key findings have emerged that underscore the critical

nature of this field in preserving humanity amidst the atrocities of war. Firstly, the analysis delineated the rich tapestry of legal instruments, both codified and customary, that govern warfare methods globally. From the foundational Geneva Conventions to the additional protocols and customary international law, it became evident that a substantial framework exists to mitigate the harsh realities of war. This normative framework acts as a moral compass, guiding parties in conflicts to respect the principles of distinction, proportionality, military necessity, and humanity.

Moreover, the deep delve into various case studies presented a vivid picture of the application, or at times, the egregious violation of IHL principles. From the analysis, it was discernible that while instances like the Rwandan Genocide and the Syrian Conflict highlighted the catastrophic consequences of breaches in IHL, other cases like protecting cultural property in Mali depicted the potential for adherence to humanitarian principles even amidst conflicts. Furthermore, the environmental repercussions witnessed during the Gulf War were a stark reminder of the necessity to include environmental protection as a significant component within IHL. In the discussion section, a critical evaluation of the effectiveness of IHL revealed its strengths and potential areas of improvement. Despite the challenges in implementation and the sometimes-lacklustre enforcement mechanisms, it was determined that the very existence of IHL plays a pivotal role in constraining the brutality of warfare. Furthermore, the recommendations posited shed light on the urgent need for continuous improvement and adaptation in IHL to meet the ever-evolving dynamics of warfare.

Herein, the significant role that international organizations can play in this endeavour became abundantly clear, with their capacity to facilitate dialogue, promote education, and foster respect for IHL globally. To conclude, this scholarly venture has underscored the critical importance of IHL in the contemporary world, especially when warfare methods are evolving rapidly with technological advancements. It behoves the global community to continue fostering a culture of respect for IHL, adapt it to the changing landscape of warfare, and strengthen the mechanisms for enforcement to ensure the preservation of human dignity even in the bleakest circumstances.

Author contributions: Samia Awad Mohamed Hassan and Somia Abdelrhman Mohamed Ali have equally contributed to the preparation/drafting of this paper.

Ethical Statement: Not Applicable

Competing Interests: The author declares that this work has no competing interests.

Grant/Funding information: The author declared that no grants supported this work.

Data Availability Statement: Not Applicable.

Declaration Statement of Generative AI: Not Applicable

REFERENCES

- Adams, T. K. (2011). Future warfare and the decline of human decisionmaking. *The US Army War College Quarterly: Parameters*, 41(4), 1. doi:10.55540/0031-1723.2600.
- Adewumi, A. A. (2015). Return and restitution of cultural property in African states under the 1970 UNESCO and 1995 UNIDROIT conventions (Doctoral dissertation). <http://hdl.handle.net/123456789/152>
- Al-Awadhi, J. M., Al-Dousari, A., & Al-Enezi, A. (2000). Barchan dunes in northern Kuwait. *Arab Gulf Journal of Scientific Research*, 18(1), 32-40.
- AlGhatrif, M., Darwish, M., Alzoubi, Z., & Shawar, Y. R. (2022). Power dynamics and health initiative design as determinants of peacebuilding: a case study of the Syrian conflict. *BMJ Global Health*, 7(Suppl 8), e007745. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1136/bmjgh-2021-007745>
- Alter, K. J. (2012). The global spread of European style international courts. *West European Politics*, 35(1), 135-154. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01402382.2012.631318>
- Arshad, M. J., & Khadam, N. (2021). Legislation for the Domestic Application of International Humanitarian Law in Pakistan. *IJLDR*, 10, 1.

- Arvidsson, M., & Sjöstedt, B. (2023). Ordering Human–Other Relationships: International Humanitarian Law and Ecologies of Armed Conflicts in the Anthropocene. *In The Routledge Handbook of International Law and Anthropocentrism*. Taylor & Francis. DOI 10.4324/9781003201120-8
- Ba, O. (2020). Contested Meanings: Timbuktu and the prosecution of destruction of cultural heritage as war crimes. *African Studies Review*, 63(4), 743-762. <https://doi.org/10.1017/asr.2020.16>
- Bartels, R. (2020). The Interplay Between International Humanitarian and Human Rights Law When Applied During International Criminal Trials. *Human Rights in War*, 1-19.
- Blackhawk, M. (2019). Federal Indian law as a paradigm within public law. *Harvard Law Review*, 132(7), 1787-1877. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/26800063>
- Boister, N. (2009). Treaty Crimes, International Criminal Court. *New Criminal Law Review*, 12(3), 341-365. <https://doi.org/10.1525/nclr.2009.12.3.341>
- Boothby, A., Wang, R., Cetnar, J., & Prasad, V. (2016). Effect of the American Society of Clinical Oncology’s conflict of interest policy on information overload. *JAMA oncology*, 2(12), 1653-1654. doi:10.1001/jamaoncol.2016.2706
- Bruch, A. (2020). *A novel method for irrigating plants, tracking water use and imposing water deficits in artificial environments* (Doctoral dissertation, University of Guelph). <http://hdl.handle.net/10214/17723>
- Bugnion, F. (2000). The Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949: From the 1949 diplomatic conference to the dawn of the new millennium. *International Affairs*, 76(1), 41-50. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1468-2346.00118>
- Clinton, P. B. (1993). Chemical Weapons Convention. US Department of State Dispatch, 4, 849-851.
- Doe, N. (1998). Canon law in the Anglican communion: a worldwide perspective. <https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780198267829.001.0001>
- Erickson, D., & Skinner, J. (2013). “A Rich Darkness”: Discovering the William Stafford Archives at Lewis & Clark College. *Oregon Historical Quarterly*, 114(4), 474-501. <https://doi.org/10.5403/oregonhistq.114.4.0474>
- Fajgelbaum, P. D., & Khandelwal, A. K. (2022). The economic impacts of the US–China trade war. *Annual Review of Economics*, 14, 205-228. <https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-economics-051420-110410>
- Foot, R. (2007). The United Nations, counter-terrorism, and human rights: Institutional adaptation and embedded ideas. *Human Rights Quarterly*, 489-514. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/20072807>
- Friedrich, M., & Johnston, T. (2013). Beauty versus tragedy: Thanatourism and the memorialization of the 1994 Rwandan Genocide. *Journal of Tourism and Cultural Change*, 11(4), 302-320. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14766825.2013.852565>
- Gardam, J., & Charlesworth, H. (2000). protection of women in armed conflict. *Hum. Rs. Q.*, 22, 148.
- Gasser, H. P. (1993). International humanitarian law. *HAUG, H., Humanity for All. Henry Dunant Institute/Paul Haupt, Berna/Stuttgart/Viena.*
- Gasser, H. P. (1994). International humanitarian law an introduction. *International Review of the Red Cross* (1961-1997), 34(298), 88-88. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0020860400081845>
- Gostin, L. O., & Rubenstein, L. S. (2022). Attacks on health care in the war in Ukraine: International law and the need for accountability. *JAMA*, 327(16), 1541-1542. doi:10.1001/jama.2022.6045
- Greenwood, C. International Humanitarian Law and the Tadić Case’(1996). *European Journal of International Law*, 7, 265.
- Hagan, J., & Levi, R. (2005). Crimes of War and the Force of Law. *Social Forces*, 83(4), 1499-1534. <https://doi.org/10.1353/sof.2005.0066>
- Holt, E. (2023). Ukrainian medic prisoners of war speak out. *The Lancet*, 402(10405), 837-838. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736\(23\)01885-8](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(23)01885-8)
- Hung, T. C., & Hung, T. W. (2022). How China's Cognitive Warfare Works: A Frontline Perspective of Taiwan's Anti-Disinformation Wars. *Journal of Global Security Studies*, 7(4), ogac016. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jogss/ogac016>
- Hüppauf, B. (1993). Experiences of modern warfare and the crisis of representation. *New German Critique*, (59), 41-76. <https://doi.org/10.2307/488223>
- Jiang, X., Li, G., & Fu, W. (2021). Government environmental governance, structural adjustment and air quality: A quasi-natural experiment based on the Three-year Action Plan to Win the Blue Sky Defense War. *Journal of Environmental Management*, 277, 111470. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2020.111470>

- Khudaykulova, M., Yuanqiong, H., & Khudaykulov, A. (2022). Economic consequences and implications of the Ukraine-Russia war. *International Journal of Management Science and Business Administration*, 8(4), 44-52. <https://doi.org/10.18775/ijmsba.1849-5664-5419.2014.84.1005>
- King, K., & Meernik, J. (2019). The burden of bearing witness: The impact of testifying at war crimes tribunals. *Journal of conflict resolution*, 63(2), 348-372. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0022002717736567>
- Koper, C. S. (2020). The potential to reduce deaths and injuries from mass shootings is assessed through restrictions on assault weapons and other high-capacity semiautomatic firearms. *Criminology & Public Policy*, 19(1), 147-170. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1745-9133.12485>
- Linton, S. (2019). Deciphering the landscape of international humanitarian law in the Asia-Pacific. *International Review of the Red Cross*, 101(911), 737-770. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S1816383120000107>
- Lostal, M. (2015). Syria's world cultural heritage and individual criminal responsibility. *International Review of Law*, 2015(1), 3. <https://doi.org/10.5339/irl.2015.3>
- Lynch, M. J., Long, M. A., Stretesky, P. B., & Barrett, K. L. (2019). Measuring the ecological impact of the wealthy: Excessive consumption, ecological disorganization, green crime, and justice. *Social Currents*, 6(4), 377-395. <https://doi.org/10.1177/2329496519847491>
- Macfarlane, S. N., Thielking, C. J., & Weiss, T. G. (2004). The Responsibility to Protect: Is anyone interested in humanitarian intervention? *Third World Quarterly*, 25(5), 977-992. <https://doi.org/10.1177/2329496519847491>
- Madley, B. (2015). Reexamining the American genocide debate: meaning, historiography, and new methods. *The American Historical Review*, 120(1), 98-139. <https://doi.org/10.1093/ahr/120.1.98>
- Malgras, B., Barbier, O., Petit, L., Rigal, S., Pons, F., & Pasquier, P. (2016). Surgical challenges in a new theatre of modern warfare: the French role 2 in Gao, Mali. *Injury*, 47(1), 99-103. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.injury.2015.07.035>
- Malone, C. M., Wycoff, K., & Turner, E. A. (2022). Applying an MTSS framework to address racism and promote mental health for racial/ethnic minority youth. *Psychology in the Schools*, 59(12), 2438-2452. <https://doi.org/10.1002/pits.22606>
- Mangku, D. G. S. (2021). Roles and Actions The Parties Should Take In The War Concerning Wound and Sick Or Dead During War or After War Under The Geneva Convention 1949. *Jurnal Komunikasi Hukum (JKH)*, 7(1), 170-178. <https://doi.org/10.23887/jkh.v7i1.31467>
- Marceau, J. (2022). Palliative animal law: The war on animal cruelty. *Green Criminology and the Law*, 217-233.
- Martin, R., Martinelli, F., & Clifton, J. (2022). Rethinking spatial policy in an era of multiple crises. *Cambridge Journal of Regions, Economy and Society*, 15(1), 3-21. <https://doi.org/10.1093/cjres/rsab037>
- Meskill, L. (2013). UNESCO's World Heritage Convention at 40: Challenging the economic and political order of international heritage conservation. *Current anthropology*, 54(4), 483-494.
- Nakashidze, G. (2020). Georgia v. Russia (II) and International Humanitarian Law: Challenge and Opportunity for the European Court of Human Rights. *J. Law*, 286.
- O'Keefe, T. (2016). Making feminist sense of no-platforming. *Feminist Review*, 113(1), 85-92. <https://doi.org/10.1057/fr.2016.7>
- Orengo, H. A., Garcia-Molsosa, A., Berganzo-Besga, I., Landauer, J., Aliende, P., & Tres-Martínez, S. (2021). New developments in drone-based automated surface survey: Towards a functional and practical survey system. *Archaeological Prospection*, 28(4), 519-526. <https://doi.org/10.1002/arp.1822>
- Park, K. S. (2021). The history wars and property law: Conquest and slavery as foundational to the field. *Yale LJ*, 131, 1062.
- Parks, W. H. (2006). Means and methods of warfare. *Geo. Wash. Int'l L. Rev.*, 38, 511.
- Patel, T. A., Mann, A. J., Halverson, T. F., Nomamiukor, F. O., Calhoun, P. S., Beckham, J. C., ... & Kimbrel, N. A. (2023). The association of military sexual assault and nonsuicidal self-injury in US Gulf War-I era veterans. *Military psychology*, 1-11. <https://doi.org/10.1080/08995605.2023.2222630>
- Peters, K. (2018). Disasters, climate change, and securitization: the United Nations Security Council and the United Kingdom's security policy. *Disasters*, 42, S196-S214. <https://doi.org/10.1111/disa.12307>

- Phillimore, G. G., & Bellot, H. H. (1919). Treatment of Prisoners of War. *Transactions Grotius Soc'y*, 5, 47.
- Rawtani, D., Gupta, G., Khatri, N., Rao, P. K., & Hussain, C. M. (2022). Environmental damages due to war in Ukraine: A perspective. *Science of The Total Environment*, 850, 157932.
- Robert, R., Agustina, R., & Nasution, B. (2022). The Rationalization of Debt Discharge Policy for Individual Debtors in Indonesian Bankruptcy Regime. *Sriwijaya Law Review*, 6(1), 101-121. <http://dx.doi.org/10.28946/slrev.Vol6.Iss1.928.pp101-121>
- Ruggie, J. (2011). Report of the secretary-general's special representative on the issue of human rights, transnational corporations, and other business enterprises: Guiding principles on business and human rights: implementing the United Nations 'protect, respect and remedy' framework. *Netherlands Quarterly of Human Rights*, 29(2), 224-253.
- Saputro, G. E., & Suwito, S. (2022). Economic Resilience In Asymmetric Warfare. *Jurnal Pertahanan: Media Informasi ttg Kajian & Strategi Pertahanan yang Mengedepankan Identity, Nasionalism & Integrity*, 8(1), 109-117. <http://dx.doi.org/10.33172/jp.v8i1.1587>
- Sassoli, M. (2014). Autonomous weapons and international humanitarian law: advantages, open technical questions and legal issues to be clarified. *International Law Studies*, 90(1), 1.
- Schillinger, J., Özerol, G., Güven-Griemert, Ş., & Heldeweg, M. (2020). Water in war: Understanding the impacts of armed conflict on water resources and their management. *Wiley Interdisciplinary Reviews: Water*, 7(6), e1480. <https://doi.org/10.1002/wat2.1480>
- Schmitt, M. N. (2004). Humanitarian law and direct participation in hostilities by private contractors or civilian employees. *Chi. J. Int'l L.*, 5, 511.
- Simonds, S. N. (1992). Conventional warfare and environmental protection: a proposal for international legal reform. *Stan. J. Int'l L.*, 29, 165.
- Subedi, S. P. (2003). The concept in Hinduism of 'Just War'. *Journal of Conflict and Security Law*, 8(2), 339-361. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jcsl/8.2.339>
- Tao, D. L., Boothby, A., McLouth, J., & Prasad, V. (2017). Financial conflicts of interest among haematologist-oncologists on Twitter. *JAMA Internal Medicine*, 177(3), 425-427. [doi:10.1001/jamainternmed.2016.8467](https://doi.org/10.1001/jamainternmed.2016.8467)
- Taylor, L. (2006). *Shining Path: guerrilla war in Peru's northern highlands*. Liverpool University Press.
- Trefalt, B. (2018). The Battle of Saipan in Japanese civilian memoirs: Non-combatants, soldiers and the complexities of surrender. *The Journal of Pacific History*, 53(3), 252-267. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00223344.2018.1491300>
- Turner, N. J., Cuerrier, A., & Joseph, L. (2022). Well grounded: Indigenous Peoples' knowledge, ethnobiology and sustainability. *People and Nature*, 4(3), 627-651. <https://doi.org/10.1002/pan3.10321>
- Usman, H., Tariq, I., & Nawaz, B. (2023). In The Realm Of The Machines: Ai's Influence Upon International Law And Policy. *Journal of Social Research Development*, 4(2), 383-399. <https://doi.org/10.53664/JSRD/04-02-2023-13-383-399>
- Vacca, A., & Onishi, H. (2017). Drones: military weapons, surveillance or mapping tools for environmental monitoring? The need for a legal framework is required. *Transportation research procedia*, 25, 51-62. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.trpro.2017.05.209>
- van Niekerk, B., Ramluckan, T., & Ventre, D. (2020, June). Assessment of the French and Dutch perspectives on international law and cyber-operations. In *19th European Conference on Cyber Warfare and Security* (pp. 380-389).
- Wang, G., Sharp, C., Plonka, A. M., Wang, Q., Frenkel, A. I., Guo, W., ... & Morris, J. R. (2017). Mechanism and kinetics for the reaction of the chemical warfare agent simulant, DMMP (g), with zirconium (IV) MOFs: an ultrahigh-vacuum and DFT study. *The Journal of Physical Chemistry C*, 121(21), 11261-11272. <https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.jpcc.7b00070>
- Zakeri, B., Paulavets, K., Barreto-Gomez, L., Echeverri, L. G., Pachauri, S., Boza-Kiss, B., ... & Pouya, S. (2022). Pandemic, war, and global energy transitions. *Energies*, 15(17), 6114. <https://doi.org/10.3390/en15176114>
- Zappalà, S. (2019). Conflict-related hunger, 'starvation crimes' and UN Security Council Resolution 2417 (2018). *Journal of International Criminal Justice*, 17(4), 881-906. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jicj/mqz047>

Publisher's Note: All claims expressed in this article are solely those of the authors and do not necessarily represent those of their affiliated organizations or the publisher, the editors and the reviewers. Any product that may be evaluated in this article or claim made by its manufacturer is not guaranteed or endorsed by the publisher

A Study on the Correlation of “Gaixia Ge” and Its English Translations from the Perspective of Experiential Metafunction

Cheng Huaming

Guangzhou College of Commerce, Guangzhou City, Guangdong Province, 511363, China

ABSTRACT

This paper attempts to analyze and compare the transitivity processes of “Gaixia Ge” by Xiang Yu and its seven English versions from the perspective of the experiential function of Halliday’s Systemic Functional Linguistics and makes a comment on the similarities and differences among them. Through the analysis of the transitivity of the poem and its translations, it is found that there are 6 versions for the first line, 2 versions for the second and the third lines, and 4 versions for the fourth line, in which the transitivity maintains a certain consistency with the original poem. After the analysis of similarities and differences between them, Spearman Correlation is applied in the SPSS. It shows that there is a significant positive relationship of transitivity between the version by Watson and the original poem, among which the translation by Watson is highly correlated with the transitivity of the original poem with the following coefficient, $\rho = 1.000$. This study can give clues to the study of poems and their translations, by exploring the differences of the transitivity processes, participants and circumstantial elements with the theoretical framework of Functional Grammar.

Keyword: Experiential metafunction; transitivity; “Gaixia Ge”; English versions; correlation


1. INTRODUCTION

“Gaixia Ge” (Chinese: 垓下歌) is a poem before the anticipated death of Xiang Yu (Chinese: 项羽), the overlord of the Western Chu. This poem summarizes Xiang Yu’s unparalleled hero image, expresses his pity for the famous foal and beauty due to the unfavorable time, and it also displays his helpless mood in the desperate situation of failure. The research on this poem mainly focuses on the comparative analysis of “Gaixia Ge” and “Dafeng Ge” (Chinese: 大风歌). For example, Tan (1975) explored the two classes reflected by the two poems, Ren (1988) compared these two poems, Liu (1995), Zhou (1998) and Wang (2006) discussed these two historical figures and their causes of success or failure, Wang (1999) contrasted the emotional mood of these two poems, and Zhang (2000) traced the historical background of the two poems. In addition, Li (1997) and Zhao (2015) interpreted the poem from literature and history perspectives. The English translation study of this poem has not yet been seen. Based on transitivity, what are the similarities and differences of each line between the original poem and the translations, and is there a positive correlation among them?

Corresponding Author: kylechm@126.com

Received: August 13, 2023; **Received in the Revised form:** September 16, 2023;

Accepted: September 21, 2023; **Available online:** October 18, 2023

This work is licensed under 

©2023 All rights reserved United Frontiers Publisher



2. METHODOLOGY

This paper will conduct an experiential metafunctional analysis of seven translations of this poem from the Systemic Functional Linguistics perspective of Halliday (2004), so as to illustrate the correlation of transitivity between these seven translations and the original poem and provide a better English version of the Chinese poem. The experiential metafunction consists of multiple semantic systems, the most important of which is the transitivity system. Its role is to divide what people see and do in the real world into several kinds of processes, and to specify the participants and circumstantial elements related to the various processes (Hu et al., 1987, p. 71). Halliday believes that people can divide their human experience into six different processes through transitivity systems: (1) material process; (2) mental process; (3) relational process; (4) behavioral process; (5) verbal process and (6) existential process (Hu et al., 2017, p. 72). The following focuses on the transitivity of the original poem and its seven English versions. It analyzes and compares the similarity and difference among them in transitivity. After the transitivity analysis of the original poem and translations, which of all lines are labeled different numbers accordingly, Spearman Correlation is applied to show whether there is a significant positive correlation of transitivity between them.

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

3.1 Experiential Metafunctional Analysis of the Poem

From the perspective of the experiential metafunctional transitivity, “Gaixia Ge” (Wu, 1992, pp. 4-5) consists of the following processes, namely:

- (1) Material process/Material process: Li Ba Shan Xi Qi Gai Shi (Chinese: 力拔山兮气盖世);
- (2) Relational process/Material process: Shi Bu Li Xi Zhui Bu Shi (Chinese: 时不利兮骓逝);
- (3) Material process/Material process: Zhui Bu Shi Xi Ke Nai He (Chinese: 骓不逝兮可奈);
- (4) Material process: Yu Xi Yu Xi Nai Ruo He (Chinese: 虞兮虞兮奈若何);

In terms of functional discourse analysis, the participant and circumstantial element associated to various processes types need to be identified. The first line of this poem contains two material processes: the first process is “Ba (Chinese: 拔),” “Li (Chinese: 力)” acts as the actor, and “Shan (Chinese: 山)” functions as the goal; the second process is “Gai (Chinese: 盖),” “Qi (Chinese: 气)” acts as the actor, and “Shi (Chinese: 世)” functions as the range. The second line comprises a relational process and a material process. In the relational process, “Shi (Chinese: 时)” is the carrier, and “Bu Li (Chinese: 不利)” is the attribute; in the material process, “Bu Shi (Chinese: 不逝)” is the process, and “Zhui (Chinese: 骓)” is the actor. The third line includes two material processes. The first part is consistent with the second part of the previous line. “Zhui (Chinese: 骓)” is the actor, and “Bu Shi (Chinese: 不逝)” is the process. “Ke Nai (Chinese: 可奈)” is another material process, and “He (Chinese: 何)” is the goal. The last line is a material process. “Nai (Chinese: 奈)” is the material process, “Yu Xi Yu Xi (Chinese: 虞兮虞兮),” and “Ruo (Chinese: 若)” are recipients, and “He (Chinese: 何)” is the goal.

3.2. Experiential Metafunctional Analysis of Its Translations

On English translations of the poem “Gaixia Ge,” these seven versions have been collected (See Appendix). For narrative convenience, the following versions are arranged by the order of time: (Watson, 1984, p. 68), (Liu & Lo, 1990, p. 29), (Xu, 1996, p. 21), (Hong et al., 2006, p. 3), (Seaton, 2006, p. 39), (Zhao, 2007, p. 180), (Liu et al., 2009, p. 29) represent these seven translations. For comparison purposes, the analysis will be performed line by line below.

3.2.1 “Li Ba Shan Xi Qi Gai Shi”

Table 1. English Versions of “Li Ba Shan Xi Qi Gai Shi”

Translated By	Process	Participant	Circumstantial
Watson	Material process: plucked up	Actor: my strength Goal: the hills	
	Material process: shadowed	Actor: my might Range: the world	
Miao	Material process: to uproot	Actor: strength I had Goal: hills	
	Material process: dominated	Actor: my spirit Range: the age	
Xu	Material process: could pull	Actor: I Goal: mountains	Place: down Manner: with main and might
Wang	Material process: could lift	Actor: I Goal: a mount	
	Material process: quell	Actor: Range: the world	
Seaton	Material process: plucked up	Actor: the strength of my arm Goal: mountains	Place: in my shade
	Material process: did set	Actor: it Range: the world	
Zhao	Material process: can uproot	Actor: I Goal: mountains	
	Material process: top	Actor: I Range: the world	
Liu	Material process: could pluck	Actor: I Goal: mountains	Contingency: if I would
	Material process: was shadowed	Actor: Range: the world entire	Manner: e'en, just, by my might

The first line “Li Ba Shan Xi Qi Gai Shi” is discussed below. In terms of the process types, participants and circumstantial elements, these seven English translations (See Appendix) are analyzed in Table 1 above. The original poem contains two material processes, Xu’s version has only one material process, and all the other translations contain two material processes. The first material process of the original poem is “Ba,” Watson’s version agrees with the material process of Seaton’s, which is “plucked up.” Similarly, Liu translates it as “could, would pluck,” which has the same verb. Miao’s is similar to the material process of Zhao’s, whose processes are “to uproot” “can uproot,” and Xu’s and Wang’s material processes are “could pull” “could lift” respectively. The actor of the first material process is either translated as “strength” or “I.” Watson’s, Miao’s, and Seaton’s versions are “my strength” “strength I had” “the strength of my arm,” and Xu’s, Wang’s, Zhao’s and Liu’s versions are “I.” Since

the translation of the target is “Shan,” Watson and Miao put it as “(the) hills,” Xu’s, Seaton’s, Zhao’s, and Liu’s versions are “mountains,” and Wang’s is “a mount.”

Another material process of the original poem is “Qi Gai Shi.” Watson’s and Liu’s processes are “shadowed” “was shadowed” respectively, which are similar but different in voice (one uses an active voice, and the other is in passive voice). Miao’s, Wang’s, Seaton’s and Zhao’s material processes are “dominated” “quell” “did set” “top” respectively. Regarding the translation of the actor, Wang’s and Liu’s actors are not translated, which are omitted according to the previous context. Watson’s and Miao’s are “my might” “my spirit,” Seaton’s is “it,” and Zhao’s is “I.” Watson’s, Wang’s, and Seaton’s versions agree with the Zhao’s range “the world,” Liu’s is “the world entire,” similar to the former, and Miao’s is “the age.” Lastly, Xu’s version also has the circumstantial element “down,” representing the space, and the circumstantial element of manner “with main and might.” Seaton’s translation has a circumstantial element of space “in my shade,” while Liu’s has circumstantial elements “if I would” “e’en, just, by my might,” representing the contingency and manner. Through analysis, this line should be translated into two material processes, and Watson’s version is more in line with the original poem. Wen (1989, p. 16) believed that “this translation maintains the spirit of the original text, and the text is appropriate.” Now this version can be revised as “My strength plucked up the mountain; my might shadowed the world.”

3.2.2 “Shi Bu Li Xi Zhui Bu Shi”

Table 2. English Versions of “Shi Bu Li Xi Zhui Bu Shi”

Translated By	Process	Participant	Circumstantial
Watson	Relational process: were	Carrier: the times Attribute: against me	
	Material process: runs	Actor: dapple Goal:	Time: no more
Miao	Material process: cannot flee	Actor: my dappled steed Goal:	Time: now in this hour of misfortune
	Material process: wanes	Actor: my good fortune Goal:	
Xu	Material process: won’t fight	Actor: my steed Goal:	
	Material process: fails	Actor: my steed Goal: me	Manner: e’en Time: at times absurd
Seaton	Relational process: wasn’t	Carrier: the time Attribute: right	
	Material process: can not break away	Actor: bold dapple Goal:	Time: now Manner: even Contingency: out of fortune
Zhao	Material process: will stop	Actor: my steed Goal:	Time: now
	Material process: should be forsaken	Actor: Goal: one	Time: once by luck
Liu	Material process: would fail to fight	Actor: one’s battle steed Goal:	

Now the translation of the second line “Shi Bu Li Xi Zhui Bu Shi” (See Appendix) is analyzed in Table 2. This original poem contains two processes: relational and material. Watson’s and Seaton’s two processes are consistent with the original poem. The relational process of Watson’s is “were,” the

carrier is “the times,” and the attribute is “against me.” The relational process of Seaton’s is “wasn’t,” the carrier is “the time,” the attribute is “right,” “now” and “even” are the circumstantial elements of time and manner respectively. The second material process of Watson’s and Seaton’s is to translate “Zhui Bu Shi.” Watson’s material process is “cannot break away,” the actor is “bold dapple,” and “no more” is the circumstantial element of time. Seaton’s material process is “runs,” and the actor is “dapple.”

Xu’s and Liu’s translations have two material processes. The first material process of Xu’s is “waned,” and the actor is “my good fortune”; the second material process is “won’t fight,” and the actor is “my steed.” Correspondingly, the first material process of Liu’s is “should be forsaken,” the target is “one”; the second material process is “would fail to fight,” and the actor is “one’s battle steed.” There is another circumstantial element of time “once by luck” in Liu’s version. Miao’s, Wang’s and Zhao’s versions have only one material process. The material process of Miao’s is “cannot flee,” the actor is “my dappled steed,” and “now in this hour of misfortune” is the circumstantial element, representing the concept of time. The material process of Wang’s is “fails,” the actor is “my steed,” and the target is “me.” It also has the circumstantial elements of time “e’en” “at times absurd.” Both versions explain “Zhui Bu Shi.” The material process of Zhao’s is “will stop,” the actor is “my steed,” and “out of fortune” “now” are circumstantial elements of contingency and time. The actor of these three versions is the same “steed.” To keep it consistent with the original poem process, this line can be translated as “But now the time is not right; my steed does not run any more.”

3.2.3 “Zhui Bu Shi Xi Ke Nai He”

Table 3. English Versions of “Zhui Bu Shi Xi Ke Nai He”

Translated By	Process	Participant	Circumstantial
Watson	Material process: runs	Actor: dapple Goal:	Time: no more
	Material process: can do	Actor: I Goal: what Carrier: dappled steed	Time: then
Miao	Relational process:	Attribute: unable to break away	
	Material process: is left	Actor: Goal: what hope	
Xu	Material process: will fight	Actor: my steed Goal:	
	Mental process: do not care	Senser: I Phenomenon:	
Wang	Material process: cannot preserve	Actor: my steed Goal: my life	
	Material process: be trapped	Actor: Goal: my dapple	
Seaton	Existential process: is	Existent: no hope for any deed	
	Material process: will stop	Actor: my steed Goal:	
Zhao	Material process: can do	Actor: I Goal: what	
	Material process: ’s to be done	Actor: Goal: what	Accompaniment: with my steed now spent

Then Table 3 presents the translation analysis of the third line “Zhui Bu Shi Xi Ke Nai He.” (See Appendix) This original poem contains two material processes. Watson’s and Zhao’s versions include two material processes. The first material process of Watson’s is “runs,” and the actor is “dapple”; the second material process is “can do,” the actor is “I,” the target is “what,” and “no more” “then” are the circumstantial elements of time. The first material process of Zhao’s is “will stop,” the actor is “my steed,” and the second material process is consistent with Watson’s.

Miao’s version consists of a relational process and a material process, the carrier of relational process is “dappled steed,” and the attribute is “unable to break away”; the material process is “is left,” and the target is “what hope.” Xu’s translation has a material process and a mental process: the material process is “will fight,” and the actor is “my steed”; the mental process is “do not care,” and the senser is “I.” Seaton’s comprises a material process and an existential process: the material process is “be trapped,” and the target is “my dapple”; the existential process is “is,” and the existent is “no hope for any deed.” Wang’s and Liu’s versions have a material process. The material process of Wang’s is “cannot preserve,” the actor is “my steed,” and the target is “my life.” The material process of Liu’s version is “’s to be done,” the target is “what,” and “with my steed now spent” is the circumstantial element of accompaniment. Because half of the line is the same as the previous line, the translation of the line focuses on the second part “Ke Nai He,” which can be translated as “What to do now?” “What should I do?” or “What is to be done?” Hence, this line can be translated as “When my steed does not run any more, what’s to be done?”

3.2.4 “Yu Xi Yu Xi Nai Ruo He”

Table 4. English Versions of “Yu Xi Yu Xi Nai Ruo He”

Translated by	Process	Participant	Circumstantial
Watson	Relational process: will be	Carrier: Yü, my Yü, your fate Attribute: what	
Miao	Relational process: will become of	Carrier: lady Yü, my Yü, you Attribute: what	
Xu	Material process: can do	Actor: I Goal: what	Accompaniment: with you, my lady fair
Wang	Material process: can do	Actor: I Goal: what Recipient: you, my dear wife	
Seaton	Existential process: could be	Existent: what hope Recipient: you, my lady Yu, thee Actor: I	
Zhao	Material process: can do	Goal: what Recipient: my lady, my lady	
Liu	Material process: to be spared	Actor: Goal: Recipient: thyself	Accompaniment: with thee, my fair

Lastly, the translation of the fourth line “Yu Xi Yu Xi Nai Ruo He” (See Appendix) is illustrated in Table 4. The original line of this poem is a material process. Watson’s and Miao’s, Seaton’s are the existential process, and Xu’s, Wang’s, Zhao’s and Liu’s are the material process. The relational process of Watson’s is “will be,” the carrier is “Yu, my Yu, your fate,” and the attribute is “what”; Miao’s relational process is “will become of,” the carrier is “lady Yu, my Yu, you,” and the attribute is “what.” The existential process of Seaton’s is “could be,” the existent is “what hope,” and “you, my lady Yu,

thee” is the recipient. The material process of Xu’s, Wang’s and Zhao’s is “can do,” the actor is “I,” the target is “what,” all of which are consistent. Xu’s version also indicates the circumstantial element of accompaniment “with you, my lady fair.” Wang’s and Zhao’s have additional recipients “you, my dear wife” “my lady, my lady.” The material process of Liu’s is “to be spared,” the recipient is “thyself,” and “with thee, my fair” represents the circumstantial element of accompaniment. Combined with the analysis, this line has only one material process, and is similar to the second half of the previous line, which can be tentatively translated as “Ah Yu, Ah Yu, what’s to be done for you?”

3.2.5 Correlation of Transitivity

Table 5. Spearman Correlation of Transitivity

			Correlations							
			Original							
			Poem	Watson	Miao	Xu	Wang	Seaton	Zhao	Liu
Spearman's rho	Original Poem	Correlation Coefficient	1.000	1.000**	-.316	.500	.000	.949	.000	.707
		Sig. (2-tailed)	.	.	.684	.500	1.000	.051	1.000	.293
		N	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
Watson	Correlation Coefficient	Correlation Coefficient	1.000**	1.000	-.316	.500	.000	.949	.000	.707
		Sig. (2-tailed)	.	.	.684	.500	1.000	.051	1.000	.293
		N	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
Miao	Correlation Coefficient	Correlation Coefficient	-.316	-.316	1.000	.316	.258	-.200	.894	-.447
		Sig. (2-tailed)	.684	.684	.	.684	.742	.800	.106	.553
		N	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
Xu	Correlation Coefficient	Correlation Coefficient	.500	.500	.316	1.000	-.544	.738	.236	-.236
		Sig. (2-tailed)	.500	.500	.684	.	.456	.262	.764	.764
		N	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
Wang	Correlation Coefficient	Correlation Coefficient	.000	.000	.258	-.544	1.000	-.258	.577	.577
		Sig. (2-tailed)	1.000	1.000	.742	.456	.	.742	.423	.423
		N	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
Seaton	Correlation Coefficient	Correlation Coefficient	.949	.949	-.200	.738	-.258	1.000	.000	.447
		Sig. (2-tailed)	.051	.051	.800	.262	.742	.	1.000	.553
		N	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
Zhao	Correlation Coefficient	Correlation Coefficient	.000	.000	.894	.236	.577	.000	1.000	.000
		Sig. (2-tailed)	1.000	1.000	.106	.764	.423	1.000	.	1.000
		N	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
Liu	Correlation Coefficient	Correlation Coefficient	.707	.707	-.447	-.236	.577	.447	.000	1.000
		Sig. (2-tailed)	.293	.293	.553	.764	.423	.553	1.000	.
		N	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4

** . Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

In terms of the transitivity of each line in the original poem and translations, all the lines have been labeled with different numbers according to the six processes. After the analysis of the transitivity, Spearman Correlation in Table 5 shows that there is a significant positive relationship of transitivity

between the version by Watson and the original poem ($p < 0.01$), among which the translation by Watson is highly correlated with the transitivity of the original poem with the following coefficient, $\rho = 1.000$.

3.2.6 Translation of “Gaixia Ge”

Table 6. English Versions of “Gaixia Ge”

No.	Translated by	Version
1	Watson	—
2	Miao	Song of Kai-hsia
3	Xu	XIANG YU’S LAST SONG
4	Wang	Song of Gaixia
5	Seaton	Song at Kai-hsia
6	Zhao	Song of Gaixia
7	Liu	The Last Song at Gaixia

The title of the poem “Gaixia Ge” is translated as above (See Appendix), Watson’s has no translated title. Miao’s agrees with Seaton’s as “Song of Kai-hsia,” in which here Wade-Giles romanization is used. Wang’s and Zhao’s are “Song of Gaixia,” both of which are the same, employing modern Chinese pinyin. Liu’s is “The Last Song at Gaixia,” which adds “the last.” Xu’s is “XIANG YU’S LAST SONG,” which uses the free translation method. Overall, this title can be translated as “Song at Gaixia.”

4. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

From the perspective of the experiential metafunction of Halliday’s Systemic Functional Linguistics, “Gaixia Ge” and its seven English translations have been discussed. Through a comparative analysis, and comprehensive understanding of each version, the rhyme is considered, and the original translated poem is adjusted and modified. The rhyme of the whole poem presents as “aabb,” with 14 syllables in each line. Finally, a new revised version is displayed as follows:

Song at Gaixia

Xiang Yu

My strength plucked up mountains; my might shadowed the world before.

But now the time is not right; my steed does not run any more.

When my steed does not run any more, then what is to be done?

Ah Yu, Ah Yu, what is to be done for you, my loved one?

Due to the author’s limited research on translation, this article is not a review on the translations of famous translators, but just hopes to discuss the English translation of ancient poetry from the perspective of Systemic Functional Linguistics. Through transitivity analysis of the experiential metafunction of the original poems and its English versions, the language analysis can deeply describe the transitivity of the original poems and the translations, and the differences and similarities of the participants and circumstantial elements related to the various processes, which will facilitate the more accurate understanding and translation of the original poems, and can effectively improve the level of the translation works. For future researchers, they may integrate the other two metafunctions—textual metafunction and interpersonal metafunction with ideational metafunction in the translation study of poetry.

Competing Interests: The author declares that this work has no competing interests.

Grant/Funding information: The author declared that no grants supported this work.

Data Availability Statement: Available upon reasonable request from the author

Declaration Statement of Generative AI: The Author declared that no AI tool was used for this study.

REFERENCES

- Halliday, M. A. K. & Christian M. I. M. Matthiessen. (2004). *An Introduction to Functional Grammar (3rd edition)*. London: Hodder Arnold.
- Hong, Z., Xiong, Z. Q., & Wang, R. P. (2006). *300 Early Chinese Poems*. Changsha: Hunan People's Publishing House.
- Hu, Z. L., Zhu, Y. S. & Zhang, D. L. (1987). *A Survey of Systemic Functional Grammar*. Changsha: Hunan Education Publishing House.
- Hu, Z. L., Zhu, Y. S., Zhang, D. L. & Li, Z, Z. (2017). *Xitong Gongneng Yuyanxue Gailun*. Beijing: Peking University Press.
- Li, J. (1997). Unfairness for Thousands of Years on “Gaixia Ge.” *Journal of Huaiyin Teachers College*, 2, 10. <http://www.cqvip.com/QK/82847X/19972/3001032889.html>
- Liu, G. S., Wang, Z. J. & Xu, S. J. (2009). *Chinese Classical Poems with English Translation & Comments*. Beijing: Foreign Languages Press.
- Liu, W. C. & Lo, Y. C. (1990). *Sunflower Splendor: Three Thousand Years of Chinese Poetry*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press
- Liu, Z. H. (1995). Success or Failure Depends on “Time” and “Scholar”—On “Gaixia Ge” and “Dafeng Ge.” *Reunification Forum*, 2, 40-41. DOI: CNKI:SUN:TYNT.0.1995-02-022
- Ren, Z. C. (1988). Appreciation of “Gaixia Ge” and “Dafeng Ge.” *Journal of Huaibei Coal Industry Teachers' College (Philosophy and Social Sciences)*, Z1, 136-139. <http://www.cnki.com.cn/Article/CJFDTotat-HBMS1988Z1021.htm>
- Seaton, J. P. (2006). *The Shambhala Anthology of Chinese Poetry*. Boston: Shambhala Publications, Inc.
- Tan, F. Y. (1975). A Clear Line of Happiness and Sorrow—On Liu Bang's “Dafeng Ge” and Xiang Yu's “Gaixia Ge.” *Journal of Guiyang Teachers' College*, 3, 71-73. DOI: CNKI:SUN:GZSF.0.1975-03-012
- Wang, Q. M. (1999). Good Poetry Is Not Limited to Style— On “Gaixia Ge” and “Dafeng Ge.” *Journal of Hengshui Normal College*, 3, 37-38. DOI: CNKI:SUN:HSSZ.0.1999-03-009
- Wang, W. J. (2006). “Dafeng Ge” and “Gaixia Ge”—Review on the Two Historical Figures. *Military Correspondent*, 3, 38-41+58. DOI: CNKI:SUN:XWCC.0.2006-03-023
- Watson, B. (1984). *The Columbia Book of Chinese Poetry: From Early Times to the Thirteenth Century*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Wen, S. (1989). *SHICI YINGYI XUAN*. Beijing: Foreign Language Teaching and Research Press.
- Wu, X. R. (1992). *A Dictionary of Poetry Appreciation in the Han, Wei, and Six Dynasties*. Shanghai: Shanghai Dictionary Publishing House.
- Xu, Y. C. (1996). *GOLDEN TREASURY OF CHINESE POETRY FROM HAN TO SUI*. Beijing: Peking University Press.
- Zhang, J. H. (2000). A Historical Interpretation of “Gaixia Ge” and “Dafeng Ge.” *Academics*, 1, 214-216. DOI: CNKI:SUN:SSJI.0.2000-01-021
- Zhao, J. C. (2015). A Literary and Historical Interpretation of Xiang Yu's “Gaixia Ge.” *Masterpieces Review*, 2, 14-16. DOI: CNKI:SUN:MZXS.0.2015-02-007
- Zhao, Y. C. (2007). *ON TRANSLATION OF CHINESE PEOMS*. Qingdao: Qingdao Publishing House.

Zhou, T. (1998). "Dafeng Ge" and "Gaixia Ge." *Lingdaowencui*, 3, 83-85. DOI:CNKI:SUN:LDWC.0.1998-03-029

APPENDIX①

Watson: / My strength plucked up the hills, / my might shadowed the world. / But the times were against me / and Dapple runs no more. / When Dapple runs no more, / what then can I do? / Ah Yü, my Yü, / what will your fate be? (Watson, 1984, p. 68)

Miao: // Song of Kai-hsia // / Strength I had to uproot hills, / my spirit dominated the age; / Now in this hour of misfortune, / my dappled steed cannot flee. / Dappled steed, unable to break away, / What hope is left? / Ah, Lady Yü, my Yü! / What will become of you? / (TR. RONALD C. MIAO) (Liu & Lo, 1990, p. 29)

Xu: // XIANG YU'S LAST SONG // / I could pull mountains down, oh! with main and might, / But my good fortune wanes, oh! my steed won't fight. / Whether my steed will fight, oh! I do not care. / What can I do with you, oh! my lady fair! (Xu, 1996, p. 21)

Wang: // Song of Gaixia // / I could lift a mount and quell the world, / But e'en my steed fails me at times absurd. / Now that my steed cannot preserve my life, / What can I do for you, oh my dear wife! (Hong et al., 2006, p. 3)

Seaton: // Song at Kai-hsia // / The strength of my arm plucked mountains up. Oh, / did it set the world in my shade! / But the time wasn't right, ah... / Now not even bold Dapple can break away. / And if even my Dapple be trapped? Ah, / then there is no hope for any deed. / Oh you, my Lady Yu, ah! / What hope could there be for thee... (Seaton, 2006, p. 39)

Zhao: // Song of Gaixia // / Xiang Yu / Mountains I can uproot, o the world I top. / Out of fortune now, o my steed will stop. / My steed will stop, o what can I do! / O my lady, o my lady, what can I do! (Zhao, 2007, p. 180)

Liu: // The Last Song at Gaixia // / E'en mountains I could, if I would, just pluck, / The world was shadowed entire by my might. / Should one be forsaken once by luck, / One's battle steed would fail to fight! / O what's to be done with my steed now spent? / With thee, my fair, for thyself to be spared? (Liu et al., 2009, p. 29)

Note: ① to save space, English translation lines are separated by “/” lines and titles by “//.”

Publisher's Note: All claims expressed in this article are solely those of the authors and do not necessarily represent those of their affiliated organizations or the publisher, the editors and the reviewers. Any product that may be evaluated in this article, or claim made by its manufacturer, is not guaranteed or endorsed by the publisher.

Identity Development: Analyzing the Professional Identity of After-school Tutors in China's Competitive Private Education Sector

Huang Rui¹, Wichian Intarasompun¹, Nuttamon Puchatree^{1*}

1. The Graduate School of Bansomdejchaopraya Rajabhat University, Thailand

ABSTRACT

After-school tutoring has grown rapidly in China, employing millions of tutors. However, little research explores these tutors' professional identity development. This study aims to understand the factors shaping tutors' professional identity in Nanning's private tutoring sector. In-depth semi-structured interviews were conducted with 10 experienced tutors in Nanning selected through purposive sampling. The interview questions explored four dimensions of professional identity and influencing factors. Transcripts were analyzed using qualitative coding techniques. Major Findings show that Tutors' professional identity is shaped by their values, academic background, relationships, and work context. Passion for teaching competes with business priorities. Role confusion and lack of belonging challenge identity. Clear expectations, training, and institutional support are needed. The study concludes that by analyzing tutors' identity formation, this study provides insights into strengthening the tutoring profession. Regular training programs, positive student-tutor relationships, and a supportive work environment can enhance tutors' professional identity. Findings inform policies on tutor development in China's expanding private tutoring industry.

Keywords: Professional Identity, After-school Tutors China, Development Guidelines


1. INTRODUCTION

After-school tutoring has gained popularity globally, with practically every nation now offering some form of after-school instruction. The after-school tutoring industry's market size in primary and secondary schools exceeded 800 billion yuan, with more than 137 million students and 7 million to 8.5 million teachers in tutoring institutions in China alone (China Daily, 2021). The high participation rates in math, foreign languages, and natural sciences among students in countries such as Greece, South Korea, and Bulgaria, have made after-school tutoring grow significantly throughout the last 25 years of the 20th century, especially in East Asia (Bray, 2022). However, after-school tutoring has social, economic, and pedagogical ramifications that researchers and policymakers are starting to pay special attention to.

A strong professional identity is important for individuals as it provides a sense of purpose and direction, builds trust and credibility with colleagues and clients, and facilitates ongoing learning and development (Zhao, 2022). The original, definitive concept of "professional identity" is not attributed to a single source or individual. It is a concept that has evolved over time through scholarly research and discourse in various fields, including education, psychology, and organizational studies. Generally speaking, professional identity refers to the characteristics, values, beliefs, and behaviors that define an

*Corresponding Author: nuttamon.pu@bsru.ac.th

Received: September 19, 2023; **Received in the Revised form:** November 28, 2023; **Accepted:** December 15, 2023; **Available online:** December 28, 2023

This work is licensed under 

©2023 All rights reserved United Frontiers Publisher



individual's professional role and identity within a particular field or industry. The study explores the outcomes and processes of after-school education teachers' identities to understand whether tutors can reconcile their dual identities and how they understand and develop their identities, contributing to an in-depth understanding of the nature and characteristics of their profession and the trajectories of their actions under the influence of their identities.

With tutoring's commercialization, tutors balance profit motives and educational values (Kwo & Bray, 2014). By interviewing experienced tutors, this study examines factors shaping their identity and recommends enhancing their growth and status as professionals, addressing a key gap in research. The research includes interviews with K-12 extracurricular tutors, encompassing subjects such as arts, sports, and academic disciplines, providing a comprehensive perspective on the diverse roles these educators play in the tutoring industry. The research questions are:

1. What factors influence the professional identity of experienced private tutors in Nanning?

2. How can tutors' professional identity and development be strengthened through policy and institutional support?

This study contributes new insights into tutors' identity formation amidst the privatization of education. Findings will inform efforts to elevate tutoring as a profession in China's expanding after-school industry.

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Shadow education / After-school tutoring education / Extracurricular education

The term "shadow education" originated from a study on out-of-school private tuition conducted by the International Development Research Centre of Canada in the early 1990s (Zhang & Bray 2020).

Bray (2022) defined shadow education as fee-based, subject-based, and supplemental tutoring.

In China, Wang (1997) was the first to define after-school tutoring as private and remedial instruction for primary and secondary school students.

Peng (2007) summary of foreign studies on extracurricular tuition revealed that it is privately funded and complements mainstream education based on academic curricula.

2.2 Maslow's Hierarchy of Needs and teachers' professional identities

Maslow's hierarchy of needs is a theory proposed by Abraham Maslow in his 1943 paper "A theory of Human Motivation" (Maslow, 1943).

The connection between Maslow's Hierarchy of Needs Theory and teachers' professional identity has been explored in various studies. Maslow's theory, which posits a hierarchy of human needs from physiological needs to self-actualization, has been applied to understand the needs and motivations of teachers in their professional roles. For instance, a study by Yilmaz & Ilhan (2017) touches upon how Maslow's hierarchy and the hierarchy of teachers' identities intersect, suggesting that the fulfillment of basic needs influences teachers' professional identity.

Additionally, the work of Xu (2023) indicates the importance of belonging and love, components of Maslow's hierarchy, in shaping teachers' sense of professional identity. These studies collectively highlight how the satisfaction of different levels of needs as per Maslow's theory can impact the development and perception of a teacher's professional identity.

2.3 Factors influencing teachers' identity

Research by Van et al. (2017) reveals that engagement in staff development programs and continuous learning can shape teachers' professional identities.

Wang (2018) research highlighted that formal state training, improved educational backgrounds, and increased state emphasis on youth physical fitness have significantly enhanced the identity of Chinese primary and secondary school physical education teachers.

Zhang and Wang (2021) research demonstrated that the workplace environment and contextual factors, such as school culture and leadership, have a substantial influence on a teacher's identity. Teachers' personal backgrounds and experiences can influence how they perceive their professional identity.

2.4 A structural study of teachers' professional identity

Chinese scholar Wei (2008) introduced a four-dimensional model for teachers' professional identity, which includes centrality, valence, solidarity, and self-presentation. In her doctoral dissertation, Wei Shuhua conducted a comprehensive study, combining theoretical development and empirical research. Her findings identified that the professional identity structure of Chinese primary and secondary school teachers comprises four dimensions: occupational values, role values, occupational sense of belonging, and occupational behavioral tendencies.

Fang and Mao (2018) developed the "University Teachers' Professional Identity Questionnaire" based on four dimensions: professional value identity, professional emotional identity, professional competence identity, and professional social status identity. He conducted a questionnaire survey with 441 university teachers and found that the current level of professional identity among university teachers is generally moderate.

In contemporary research, the focus often lies on clarifying the structural aspects of teacher identity using literature analysis, which results in the development of a multidimensional structural framework. Nonetheless, there remains a lack of unanimous agreement on this subject. In the present study, the researcher introduces a four-dimensional framework to encompass teacher identity, comprising professional cognition, professional emotion, professional will, and professional behaviors.

2.5 Double Reduction Policy

In July 2021, the Chinese government released the "Opinions on Further Reducing the Burden of Homework and Off-campus Tutoring for Students at the Stage of Compulsory Education" policy, known as the Double Reduction (双减) policy (CCP Central Committee & State Council, 2021). This landmark education reform aims to ease excessive academic pressure on primary and secondary school students by reducing excessive homework and restricting after-school tutoring institutions (ASTIs) (Yuan, 2022).

Specifically, the Double Reduction policy includes measures such as banning written homework for first and second graders, capping daily written homework time, improving quality of in-school teaching, expanding after-school services, tightening approval and regulation of ASTIs, controlling tutoring fees, and enhancing coordination across government departments (CCP Central Committee & State Council, 2021). This reform responds to public concerns about student overwork and reflects the government's increasing prioritization of child wellbeing over academic achievement (Zuo, 2021).

Early research shows the policy has led to positive changes like less homework and reduced tutoring participation, but there are ongoing challenges in implementation and monitoring (Zhou & Peng, 2023). Critics argue the top-down approach overemphasizes control and neglects providing quality public education alternatives (Wang, 2021). The "Double Reduction" policy signals a historic shift in China's competitive education system, but further research is needed on its long-term effects on educational equity, quality, and student development.

3.METHODOLOGY

To study the current situation of tutors' professional identity in private institutes and further optimization of professional identity, the researchers have the following procedures.

3.1 The Sample Group

This qualitative study explores the professional identity of tutors at private after-school tutoring institutions in Nanning, China. In-depth semi-structured interviews were conducted with 10 tutors to gain insights into factors shaping their professional identity and recommendations for enhancing it. Notably, interviews were conducted in Chinese and translated to English by the researcher.

3.2 Participant Selection

Purposive sampling was used to recruit experienced tutors in leadership roles at reputable institutes who could provide rich perspectives. Tutors had to have at least 5 years of experience and be willing to participate in hour-long interviews. The small sample size of 10 enabled deeper exploration of individuals' experiences.

3.3 Data Collection and Interviewee Recruitment

The recruitment strategy leverages the researcher's personal and professional networks, involving colleagues, friends, and acquaintances in the search for suitable interviewees. Potential participants are required to meet specific recognition and success criteria, including:

Experience: A minimum of 5 years' experience as a private tutor or coach in a tutoring institution.

Position: Holding a title indicating a level of responsibility within the institution, such as head tutor, senior tutor, or tutor supervisor, or being the institution owner.

Diversity: An effort is made to ensure a gender-balanced representation among the interviewees.

Variety: A mix of subject tutors and interest-based class tutors is sought among the interviewees.

These eligibility criteria are designed to identify experienced and successful tutors with a comprehensive understanding of the tutoring industry, contributing to the exploration of their professional identity, challenges, rewards, and motivations.

Before interviews commence, a series of key preparation steps are taken:

Equipment Testing: The researcher rigorously tests the equipment, ensuring the functionality of recording devices and audio quality. Adequate memory capacity is verified to capture the entire interview.

Location Selection: Interviews are conducted in a comfortable and private setting, either at a quiet cafe or via online platforms like Tencent Meeting.

Informing Participants: Potential interviewees receive detailed information about the study, including its purpose, expected time commitment, and any incentives for participation. The voluntary nature of their involvement and the option to withdraw from the study at any point are emphasized during this pre-interview communication.

In summary, the data collection and recruitment strategy is strategically structured to gather insights from experienced and successful tutors in the private tutoring sector. The preparation process ensures the technical and ethical integrity of the interviews, ultimately contributing to a comprehensive understanding of their professional identities and experiences.

3.4 Data Analysis

Transcripts were coded using thematic analysis to identify common themes related to the research questions on factors influencing tutor identity and ways to strengthen it. Key themes were categorized, interpreted, and reported with illustrative quotes.

4. RESULTS AND ANALYSIS

4.1 Basic Information

Table 1 Background of ten tutors

Item	Frequency	Percentage
Gender		
-Male	4	40%
-Female	6	60%
Age		
-25 to 30	6	60%
-31 and above	4	40%
Duration of Tutoring Career		
-5 years to 10 years	8	80%
-11 years and above	2	20%
Education Level		
-Diploma	2	20%
-Bachelor	6	60%
-Master	2	20%
Current Position		
-Owner	4	40%
-Employee	6	60%
Duty		
-Administration and teaching	5	50%
-Teaching or coaching	5	50%
Qualification		
-Teacher qualification certificate	6	60%
-Other professional qualification		
-Both	2	20%
	2	20%
Teaching Training Programme		
-Yes	10	100%
-No	0	0
Understanding of Professional Identity		
-Yes	9	90%
-No	1	10%

Table 1 presents the demographic and professional background of ten tutors. The table is structured around various items, including gender, age, duration of tutoring career, education level, current position, duty, qualification, teaching training, and understanding of professional identity. The data is presented in terms of frequency and percentage.

4.2 Professional Cognition

The interviews revealed that most tutors primarily identified as teachers driven by a passion for education. As a 35-year-old male English tutor stated: "I see myself as a teacher first. My goal is to help students learn, not just earn a paycheck." (Interviewee A). This aligns with previous research showing that identity stems from perceived purpose and personal values (Beijaard et al., 2004).

However, some tutors also acknowledged their dual role as business owners and employees tasked with administrative duties. A 29-year-old female piano tutor explained: "While teaching is my

priority, I have to balance that with managing institute operations and sales. The business side is a necessity" (Interviewee B). This highlights the tensions tutors face between professional values and market realities (Kwo & Bray, 2014).

All tutors emphasized the importance of continuous training, such as the 37-year-old male basketball coach who stated: "Regular coaching workshops help me improve and stay updated on new techniques" (Interviewee C). This links to literature on the need for ongoing professional development to strengthen identity (Trent, 2010).

4.3 Professional Emotion

The tutors expressed general satisfaction and support in their roles. A 45-year-old female Chinese literature tutor said: "I feel fulfilled when students make progress thanks to my teaching" (Interviewee D). However, some noted role confusion, like the 32-year-old male math tutor who stated: "I sometimes feel torn between my duties as an educator and an employee" (Interviewee E). Literature shows teacher identity can be fragmented when responsibilities conflict (Pillen et al., 2013).

Positive student feedback is indeed a significant motivator for teachers and plays a crucial role in sustaining their professional identity. This is highlighted in the work of Izadinia (2014) who reviewed the literature on teacher educators' identity. According to Izadinia, such affirmation from students helps teachers validate their efforts and contributes to the development and maintenance of their professional identity. This concept is supported by the statement of a 28-year-old male fine arts tutor who finds validation in student feedback, emphasizing the importance of positive reinforcement in their teaching role (Izadinia, 2014).

4.4 Professional Will

The tutors emphasized goal-setting, rest, and values alignment to maintain motivation and withstand pressure. However some described ethical dilemmas regarding fees and student placement. As a 55-year-old female logical thinking tutor explained: "I want to help every student succeed, but sometimes their needs exceed my qualifications" (Interviewee G). Research shows such dilemmas can undermine educators' sense of purpose (Elango et al., 2015).

Most tutors prioritized their teaching responsibilities over other interests when needed. However, literature suggests a prolonged imbalance between work and life can threaten professionals (Cinamon, 2016).

4.5 Professional Behavior

Behaviors like preparation, parent communication, and caring for students were seen as vital. A 25-year-old male basketball coach stated: "Lesson planning and rapport with parents are key to being a professional tutor" (Interviewee H). Sales skills also proved important for some tutors' incomes and institutions' success. But there are concerns such commercial activities could detract from teaching quality (Zhang, 2014).

Institutes that provided training, incentives, and clear expectations helped reinforce positive behaviors. As a 40-year-old female fine arts tutor explained: "Workshops on communicating with parents have really boosted my confidence" (Interviewee I). This aligns with research showing organizational support aids teacher identity (Schepens et al., 2009).

5. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

This study explored the professional identity of experienced tutors at after-school private institutes in Nanning, China. The findings reveal the multifaceted nature of tutors' identities shaped by their values, relationships, and work context.

Most tutors were driven by a passion for education, which competed with business priorities. This echoes previous research on marketized tutoring. However, this study provides a nuanced perspective on how tutors navigate this tension.

Tutors expressed role confusion but felt pride seeing students' progress, aligning with literature on emotional impacts. This study enriches understanding of tutors' specific challenges and motivations.

Setting goals and upholding ethics sustained motivation, though dilemmas arose regarding fees and student-fit, furthering insights into tutors' will. Balancing obligations also proved difficult, highlighting risks of work-life imbalance.

Required behaviors like communication and caring were central for tutors, though sales skills presented a quandary between quality and revenue, an issue this study explores in depth. Institutional support aided growth.

In summary, by analyzing tutors' identity formation, this study offers new perspectives on strengthening tutoring as a profession amidst the privatization of education in China. Recommendations around clarifying roles, enhancing training, and elevating status can help tutors develop a coherent identity and thrive. Further research on policies supporting tutors is warranted.

6.LIMITATIONS AND FUTURE STUDIES

For a more comprehensive understanding of the after-school tutoring industry's impact and policy regulations, future research should expand its scope. This includes gathering data from a larger and more diverse group of teachers across different institutions. Recognizing that each teacher's background, experiences, beliefs, and values are distinct and may change over time is crucial. Moreover, as this study primarily focuses on teachers in small institutions and studios, future studies should more accurately categorize the target population to enhance research precision.

Author contributions: Huang Rui was responsible for the conception, design, and writing of the manuscript. The advisors provided critical revisions, guidance on the research direction, and insightful feedback to enhance the study's quality and integrity. All authors have read and agreed to the published version of the manuscript.

Consent to Participate: All the respondents were informed about the objectives of the study. They were informed that they could withdraw from the interview at any stage when they felt uneasy or did not want to participate. All the informants were also informed that their personal information would not be exposed. The researchers followed all other ethical guidelines necessary for qualitative study.

Competing Interests: The author declares that this work has no competing interests.

Grant/Funding information: The author declared that no grants supported this work

Data Availability Statement: The associated data is available upon reasonable request from the corresponding author.

Declaration Statement of Generative AI: This statement serves to affirm that no artificial intelligence (AI) was utilized in this study, with the sole exception being for grammar-checking purposes.

Acknowledgements: Heartfelt thanks to Associate Professor Dr. Wichian Intarasompun for his guidance, support, and expertise in education management, and to Assistant Professor Dr. Nuttamon Puchatree for her insightful feedback and assistance in qualitative research. Gratitude is extended to the participating tutors for their valuable contributions and to my family and friends for their constant support and encouragement throughout this research journey.

REFERENCES

- Beijaard, D., Meijer, P. C., & Verloop, N. (2004). Reconsidering research on teachers' professional identity. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 20(2), 107-128.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2003.07.001>
- Bray M. (2022) Shadow Education in Asia and the Pacific: Features and Implications of Private Supplementary Tutoring. In: Lee W.O., Brown P., Goodwin A.L., Green A. (eds) *International Handbook on Education Development in Asia-Pacific*. Springer, Singapore.
https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-16-2327-1_10-1
- CCP Central Committee & State Council. (2021, July, 24). *Opinion on further reducing the burden of homework and off-campus tutoring for students at the stage of compulsory education*. Retrieved

- from
http://www.moe.gov.cn/jyb_xxgk/moe_1777/moe_1778/202107/t20210724_546576.html
- Cinamon, R. G. (2016). Integrating work and family identities among emerging adults pursuing both family and career goals. *Journal of Adult Development*, 23(3), 152-164.
<https://doi.org/10.1007/s10804-016-9228-3>
- Elango, S., García, J. L., Heckman, J. J., & Hojman, A. (2015). *Early childhood education. In Economics of means-tested transfer programs in the United States*, University of Chicago Press.
- Fang, M., & Mao, J. (2008). Investigation and Analysis of the Current Status of Professional Identity of University Teachers in China. *Higher Education Research*, 56-61. Retrieved from
https://kns.cnki.net/kcms2/article/abstract?v=tc18asgQ17T52gq0ThuWBOu6tAb3TqLrZ57CdIKYk_BPWukxbQuOdeA6M4-U0F3RrbmlhvVBZ5i2UJGHRVSOqOrHo5R05ke6ahzM_ObpHQYi8embyKeotZhoFi7x4QiYvuY_RPyVQTbqA=&uniplatform=NZKPT&language=CHS
- Hu, Y. (2021, September 13). The extracurricular tutoring industry's market size exceeds 800 billion yuan. China Daily. Retrieved from
<https://www.chinadaily.com.cn/a/201807/03/WS5b3ac855a3103349141e049b.html>
- Izadinia, M. (2014). Teacher educators' identity: A review of literature. *European Journal of Teacher Education*, 37(4), 426-441. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02619768.2014.947025>
- Zou, S. (2021, May 19). Tutoring irregularities prompt crackdown. China Daily. Retrieved from
https://www.chinadaily.com.cn/a/202105/19/WS60a451d7a31024ad0babfd8b_2.html
- Kwo, O., & Bray, M. (2014). Understanding the nexus between mainstream schooling and private supplementary tutoring: Patterns and voices of Hong Kong secondary students. *Journal of Asian Public Policy*, 7(3), 215-232. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02188791.2014.961900>
- Maslow, A. H. (1943). A theory of human motivation. *Psychological Review*, 50(4), 370-396.
<https://doi.org/10.1037/h0054346>
- Peng, P. (2007). Shadow education: Research and implications on extracurricular tutoring abroad. *Foreign Primary and Secondary Education*, (9), 61-65. Retrieved from
https://kns.cnki.net/kcms2/article/abstract?v=tc18asgQ17RS2iGakI189q4io8OUdvB0vwXtJD_oBwz_tyJ3-XbjeWiMhKsYF2zosEf1ZBTk-h6NVj9H4Gmispjop_rROxtqcM5eatHpEj_a4LONcd4GOwrBisuCeS8PNyL_C4Lz5zaNc=&uniplatform=NZKPT&language=CHS
- Pillen, M., Beijgaard, D., & den Brok, P. (2013). Professional identity tensions of beginning teachers. *Teachers and Teaching*, 19(6), 660-678. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13540602.2013.827455>
- Schepens, A., Aelterman, A., & Vlerick, P. (2009). Student teachers' professional identity formation: between being born as a teacher and becoming one. *Educational studies*, 35(4), 361-378.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/03055690802648317>
- Trent, J. (2010). Teacher education as identity construction: Insights from action research. *Journal of Education for Teaching*, 36(2), 153-168. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02607471003651672>
- Van Lankveld, T., Schoonenboom, J., Volman, M., Croiset, G., & Beishuizen, J. (2017). Developing a teacher identity in the university context: A systematic review of the literature. *Higher education research & development*, 36(2), 325-342.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/07294360.2016.1208154>
- Wang, D. (2021). The control-support dilemma in China's new policies for lower academic burden. *Chinese Education & Society*, 54(4-5), 372-381.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/10611932.2022.2111542>
- Wang, Y. E. (2018). Influencing factors of college sports teachers' professional identity. *Sports*, (2), 113-114. Retrieved from https://www.zhangqiaokeyan.com/academic-journal-cn_sport_thesis/0201230250106.html
- Wang, Y. S. (1997). Remedial education: A kind of educational phenomenon that cannot be ignored. *Shanghai Educational Research*, 6(18), 19-24. <https://doi.org/10.16194/j.cnki.31-059/g4.1997.06.005>
- Wei, S. H. (2008). *A study on teachers' professional identity* (Doctoral dissertation, Xinan University, Chongqing).

- Zhou, Z. & Peng, L. (2023). Research and thoughts on the implementation of the "Double Reduction" policy over the past year. *Weishi* (01), 65-67. Retrieved from https://kns.cnki.net/kcms2/article/abstract?v=tc18asgQ17TozAj6RoT2J6hwDfv_YLAqdME7wH5_YM-w2IBQwJFErPGa-6IudZJEJTtyrolU-v36EO6P6xA01u5W6Ue7sgN-XjzicZQsaGtY_9c_zV6TVg2fzWb27ybyB7HlymJFFfBu5Ot5OgAtg==&uniplatform=NZKP_T&language=CHS
- Zhang, Y., & Wang, P. (2021). Twenty Years' Development of Teacher Identity Research: A Bibliometric Analysis. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 12, 783913. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2021.783913>
- Zhang, W., & Bray, M. (2020). Comparative research on shadow education: Achievements, challenges, and the agenda ahead. *European Journal of Education*, 55(3), 322-341. <https://doi.org/10.1111/ejed.12413>
- Zhang, Y. (2014). The marketisation of public education in China: A critical appraisal. *Journal of Contemporary Asia*, 44(2), 269-287. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00472336.2013.834490>
- Zhao, Q. (2022). On the Role of Teachers' Professional Identity and Well-Being in Their Professional Development. *Frontiers in psychology*, 13, 913708. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2022.913708>
- Xu, L., Duan, P., Ma, L., & Dou, S. (2023). Professional Identity and Self-Regulated Learning: The Mediating Role of Intrinsic Motivation and the Moderating Role of Sense of School Belonging. *SAGE Open*, 13(2), 21582440231177034.
- Yilmaz, F., & Ilhan, M. (2017). Who are teachers? A study of identity hierarchy. *Cogent Education*, 4(1). <https://doi.org/10.1080/2331186X.2017.1384638>
- Yuan, L. (2022). Double reduction policy and after-school tutoring businesses in China: Implementation, challenges, and strategies. *Human Behavior and Emerging Technologies*, 4(3), 611-617. <https://doi.org/10.1002/hbe2.287>

Publisher's Note: All claims expressed in this article are solely those of the authors and do not necessarily represent those of their affiliated organizations or the publisher, the editors and the reviewers. Any product that may be evaluated in this article, or claim made by its manufacturer, is not guaranteed or endorsed by the publisher.

Otherness in Arundhati Roy's "The Ministry of Utmost Happiness"

Urooj Babar¹, Shehryar Ahmed^{2*}

1.Faculty of Humanities, Department of English Studies, Abdul Wali Khan University Mardan, KP, Pakistan

2.MILA University Putra Nilai, Negeri Sembilan, Malaysia [Formerly known as Manipal International University]

ABSTRACT

This research delves into an examination of the marginalization process by closely analyzing Arundhati Roy's work, "The Ministry of Utmost Happiness." The objective is to uncover how Roy employs her artistic prowess to bridge the gap between marginalized segments and the mainstream, thereby attempting to rejuvenate the former glory of the Indian societal framework. Through the lens of oriental discourse, this study scrutinizes the novel, particularly emphasizing the strategic foothold achieved within the established system through acts of rebellious creativity, unconventional thinking, and alternative lifestyles. This study elucidates the intricate interconnections among the novel's multi-layered narratives, which lay bare the harsh realities of society, such as the dire circumstances faced by minority groups, the degrading existence of transgender individuals, the lackluster state of governance, the struggles of Naxalites, instances of rape, murder, social inequality, and preconceived biases. In "The Ministry of Utmost Happiness," Arundhati Roy explores societal categorization through the lens of "Otherness". Characters like Anjum embody the challenges faced by those deviating from societal norms, particularly in terms of transgender identity. The narrative extends this exploration to figures like Musaa and Talio, engaged in the Kashmiri conflict, highlighting a political form of "Otherness". The central aim of this research is to identify and delve into India's marginalized "Others," encompassing the impoverished, those deemed as "apostates," outsiders, and third-gender individuals, who are often subjected to subjugation or victimization. This study focuses on the theory surrounding the analysis of orientalist discourse and focuses on the "Otherness" of the novel's main character Anjum or Aftab who rejoice in their wretched condition and the survival creativity of these "Other" in their conditions of acute Precarity.

Keywords: The Other, Transgender, Poor, Inequality, Prejudice, Marginalization, Societal Precarity

1. INTRODUCTION

The concept of "Otherness" by Said (1978) emerges as a result of a complex process where the dominant or centered group (referred to as "Us" or "Self") constructs the marginalized or out-group (designated as "Them" or "Other") through the act of stigmatization and differentiation. This formation of otherness, often termed "othering," revolves around the adoption of a mindset that dichotomizes individuals into the categories of "us" and "them." The out-group is understood solely as its opposition to the in-group, characterized by a perceived lack of identity, often rooted in the propagation of

*Corresponding Author: Asheharyar60@gmail.com

Received: August 30, 2023; Received in the Revised form: December 1, 2023; Accepted: December 18, 2023; Available online: December 30, 2023

This work is licensed under



©2023 All rights reserved United Frontiers Publisher



stigmatized and seemingly simplistic stereotypes. In this dichotomy, the in-group not only defines the "Others" but also establishes a distinct and superior identity for themselves. It is crucial to recognize that otherness and identity are intertwined facets of a single coin, with each entity existing solely in relation to the other.

Said (1978), in his renowned work "Orientalism," reveals that the Western perspective on the Orient depicts it as "mysterious," inert, passive, pitiable, underdeveloped, and deprived. He posits that the Western viewpoint about the East is largely shaped by literature, particularly the emerging literary form of the "novel." Said (1978) contends that this biased perception lacks a rational foundation. In "Orientalism" Said (1978) points out that marginalized individuals are essential, spoken about, and on behalf of, yet their voices are perpetually suppressed and excluded. It was the Orientalists who constructed the East as the "other." This very concept is mirrored in Arundhati Roy's "The Ministry of Utmost Happiness," wherein those in positions of power craft new definitions, identities, and labels for the less privileged, designating them as "the Other." The culmination of this process of othering is the creation of a "binary opposition," echoing Said's observations in "Orientalism." This binary opposition fragments the societal population into distinct segments, establishing the dichotomy of "the Self" versus "the other."

Arundhati Roy, acclaimed as the pioneer of Indian literature to secure the Booker Award with her debut novel "The God of Small Things" (1997), dedicated a decade of her life to crafting her second literary work, "The Ministry of Utmost Happiness" (2017). This novel embarks on an internal journey spanning numerous years across the Indian subcontinent, traversing overcrowded and narrow cities, the labyrinthine lanes of Old Delhi, the expanse of the Kashmir valley, and beyond. "The Ministry of Utmost Happiness" is a narrative that seamlessly melds reality with magic, offering a narrative that is unflinchingly raw, bitter, and profoundly agonizing. Roy paints a world that is harsh and brutal, yet within every corner of this brutality, hope and kindness persist. Her narrative skillfully plays with duality to convey a message - it juxtaposes innocence with wickedness, kindness with harshness, the world of the exiled "Others" with that of the third sex, and the "Duniya," or the "normal" world. Roy weaves a vibrant tapestry, interweaving the story of Anjum, a transgender individual once known as Aftab, and the tale of love between the modern Tilottama and the Kashmiri militant Musa. Within this narrative tapestry lie numerous holes, each one prompting reflection and further exploration as the reader delves deeper into the story.

Arundhati Roy's novel (2017), "The Ministry of Utmost Happiness," consists of twelve chapters, which can be effectively partitioned into two major segments. Roy dedicates this literary work to the Uncounseled, a reference to those residing on the societal fringes, enduring various forms of 'otherization'—be it local, social, political, national, or cultural. Through this novel, Roy aims to amplify the voices of voiceless individuals within Indian society, with a significant portion of the narrative stemming from the perspectives of the marginalized sectors of society. The novel unfolds through two central narratives. The first narrative delves into the life of Anjum, a transgender individual who was born as Aftab, and the marginalized sections of Indian society. The second narrative follows Tilottama and Musa, exploring Kashmiri politics, their love story, and the deteriorated state of the natural environment. The very beginning of the novel 's story is extremely destructive and we can estimate the level and extremity of destruction by the condition of poor "friendly vultures" who usually fed on dead are now died of diclofenac poisoning. This situation gets the attention of the reader to observe and explore how the city of Delhi runs and threatens all of its residents, animals and human alike. The plot moves towards a mysterious woman living in a graveyard who is able to converse with

the ghosts of already extinct vultures, according to her, "weren't altogether unhappy at having excused themselves." (Roy, 2017).

In her novel "The Ministry of Utmost Happiness," Arundhati Roy weaves a tapestry filled with an array of "Others." These include Hijras, "apostles," political insurgents, the impoverished, women, foreigners, forsaken infant girls, and those relegated to lower status. The diverse spectrum even encompasses animals, birds, and trees, all of whom bear the brunt of injustice, inequality, exploitation, and prejudice. The novel serves as a poignant reflection of the rapidly evolving landscape of Indian democracy, characterized by the ascent of right-wing political ideologies, the precarious status of marginalized communities, ongoing turmoil in the Kashmir valley, and escalating environmental crises resulting from the relentless march of urbanization.

The research problem addressed in this study pertains to the denigration, marginalization, and oppression faced by certain groups of people, such as women, transgender individuals, "apostates," and ethnic minorities, on a global scale. Works of fiction frequently depict these groups experiencing various forms of prejudice, discrimination, and oppression. Drawing from Said's theory of Orientalism, this research centers on "The Ministry of Utmost Happiness" as its primary subject, aiming to analyze the crises faced by characters within the novel and the portrayal of social injustices, shedding light on how differences and social disparities create tensions. Two primary research questions guide this study:

1. How does the main character Anjum as "Other" in The Ministry of Utmost Happiness who exist at the periphery of society are stigmatized, exploited, and discriminated by the ones who exist at the center of the society?

2. How does the main character Anjum as "Other" 'go against customs, test new and better ways of life, carve new space for themselves, and test new roles in the society of this novel?

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

The novel "The Ministry of Utmost Happiness" reflects Arundhati Roy's distinct "political philosophy" that resonates throughout the text. The narrative predominantly addresses political subjects such as the Manipur Nationalist Movement, the displacement of Adivasi tribal communities, Maoist insurgency within Central Indian forests, the 2002 Gujarat Massacre, and the ongoing Kashmir conflict. Batra (2017) shares insights about the novel's nature, characterizing it as "undeniably a political novel." He expands on this, noting that the novel is intertwined with political figures and that its core is driven by prevailing "political issues that set much of the action in motion."

Sehgal (2017) in "Arundhati Roy 's fascinating mess" describes the novel as a "companion piece" to Roy's political writings. Through astute portrayals of notable Indian politicians like "The Poet Prime Minister" (Atal Bihari Vajpayee), the "trapped rabbit" (Manmohan Singh), the "Gandhian" (Anna Hazare), "Mr. Aggerval" (Arvind Kejriwal), and "Gujarat ka lalla" (Narendra Modi), Roy masterfully demonstrates the entwining of the narrative with the political realm and the theatricality of Indian politics over the past three decades.

Ganguly (2017) in "Arundhati Roy, The Ministry of Utmost Happiness" perceives the persistent and unbroken marginalities within the novel, asserting that it serves as an exploration of a grotesque hybrid existence that the Indian State has imposed on its citizens. Ganguly (2017) contends that Arundhati Roy adeptly unveils the corporate and state entities, which have sustained themselves through the exploitation of the nation's populace and resources, resorting to harsh measures to suppress

resistance. According to her Roy empowers the left-wing liberal intelligentsia while disapproving of the conservative right-wing forces? In her essay, Ganguly (2017) partially addresses the novel through the lens of binary opposition and marginalities, but this perspective falls short. This paper delves into the theoretical framework of "the others," with a primary focus on marginalities, as well as the concepts of "us and them," and "self and the other" as portrayed in "The Ministry of Utmost Happiness."

Khan (2017) discussed in his essay "The Truth Has a Habit to Prevail" that the narrative and terminology of Roy's novel "The Ministry of Utmost Happiness" are fundamentally non-fictional rather than fictional. Many names and incidents are based on real people and events. He observed that Aggarwal represents Arvind Kejriwal (the Prime Minister of New Delhi, the capital of India). The character of Jalib Qadri is based on the real-life figure lawyer Adv. Jalil Qadri. Major Amrik Singh's portrayal directly corresponds to the actual Major Avtar Singh. Major Avtar Singh was notorious for his ruthless behavior as a military officer in the Indian Army. His xenophobic stance against the Kashmir freedom movement led him to commit acts of violence against numerous Kashmiri freedom seekers and innocent civilians. Similar to Russell's London or Jean-Paul Sartre's Paris, Jantar Mantar, a location in the Indian capital Delhi, served as a site for protests. Just as Dickens depicted the story of the celebrated French Revolution in his novel "A Tale of Two Cities," Roy uses her novel to tell heart-wrenching stories of human rights violations and the marginalized state of India. Roy doesn't present an American dream; instead, she offers a portrayal of Indian society's reality that remains hidden beneath layers of nationalistic fervor, radicalism, extremism, Hindutva, and the concept of a "rising India."

Ghoshal (2017) undertakes an examination of the novel from the vantage point of structure, stylistics, and plot. The novel engages in a non-linear narrative approach, shuttling back and forth across history. Ghoshal (2017) notes that the novel's tone and texture defy categorization, as it seamlessly transitions from flights of sarcasm and poetic moments to bewildering reports, seemingly bearing the imprint of diverse minds and hands. The plot of the novel is expansive, weaving together multiple narrative strands in a literary manner. Embedded within the novel are numerous "dreadful clichés" concerning the distinctions between the East and the West?

2.1 Theoretical Framework

This research finds its theoretical foundation in Said's construct of "The Self" and "The Other." In this framework, "The Self" enjoys privilege and dominance, while "The Other" is subjected to marginalization and subjugation. The novel is examined through the theoretical lens of "us" and "them," with "us" occupying the central socio-political position and "them" consigned to the societal margins. A crucial thematic element, "Binary Opposition," as articulated by Said (1978) in his book "Orientalism", assists in identifying contemporary "binarism" within Indian society. This concept underscores the suffering and distress experienced by minority groups under majoritarian regimes. The novel serves as a platform for shedding light on oft-overlooked facets of Indian society, where individuals frequently navigate transitions from better to more challenging environments, and sometimes even from the city to the graveyard. Additionally, Roy's narrative highlights the anthropocentric perspective of Indian society, where nature assumes the role of "the other."

Othring involves placing a group, individual, or object in the role of the "Other", shaping one's identity by exploiting this constructed "Other". As Bauman & Times (2007) explained, Individuals existing at the societal margins or periphery are seen as the marginalized populace. They are excluded from the mainstream, confined to incomprehensible margins. Those falling under this category are frequently isolated from community life, with limited means for survival and freedom. Their lives are burdened with confusion and frustration, as the culture and society they inhabit refuse to integrate them,

preventing them from achieving normalcy in their lives. Conversely, those aligning with the mainstream majority find themselves in a position described by Bauman & Times (2007) as a "never-stopping and constantly dazzling spectacle of the city." They have access to better, healthier, and more enjoyable prospects, as (Bauman & Times, 2007) adds, "The bigger and more heterogeneous a city, the more attractions it may support and offer..." (Bauman & Times, 2007). As a result, the gap between the central and marginal areas continues to widen. If the situation of marginalized groups remains unaddressed, the societal structure is inevitably at risk of collapse.

Gabriel (2012) delves into the intricate process of Othering, "Othering is the process of casting a group, an individual or an object into the role of the 'other' and establishing one's own identity through opposition to and, frequently, vilification of this Other. The Greeks' use of the word 'barbarian' to describe non-Greeks is a typical example of othering and an instance of nationalism *avant la lettre*. The ease with which the adjective 'other' generated the verb 'to other' in the last twenty years or so is indicative of the usefulness, power and currency of a term that now occupies an important position in feminist, postcolonial, civil rights and sexual minority discourses (Gabriel, 2012).

The process of Othering extends beyond mere scapegoating and degradation, stripping the Other of essential attributes shared with the 'Same': reason, dignity, love, pride, heroism, nobility, and, fundamentally, any claim to human rights. Whether the other represents a racial or religious group, a gender group, a sexual minority, or a nation, it becomes susceptible to exploitation, oppression, and even genocide through the denial of its inherent humanity. This is because, as articulated by philosopher Rorty (1998), "everything hinges on who qualifies as a fellow human being, as a rational agent in the only relevant sense – the sense in which rational agency is synonymous with membership of our moral community." (Rorty, 1998).

Lacan (1998) observed how "self" forms in the early stages of childhood when a child begins to anticipate his face in the mirror. The child first considers himself to be "Other" and misidentifies him/herself as a subject, and later maintains this perception in the eyes of others. Therefore, there is an interesting link between the theory of alienation and the other. Othering is a procedure that can be applied to oneself, thereby allowing one to know oneself as an unknown person. In fact, Lacanian theory sees this "self-otherness" as a way to establish symbolic order. He proclaims that the unconscious is an unknown person in us. For example, a man has no choice but to silence or kill the "woman in him".

Thibierge & Morin, (2010) notes, "that there is a fundamental flaw in the perception or image dimensions, —upholding an image or a meaning always turns out to be precarious and under threat This is why, in psychosis – regardless of the apparent solidity of certain delusional edifices, where there is an attempt to suture this fault- a complete collapse of the subject's imagery coordinates is always liable to occur, that is, a complete collapse of what we call recognition." (Thibierge & Morin, 2010).

Levi-Strauss (1992) asserts that throughout human history, two strategies have been applied to deal with others, deviants, foreigners, or strangers. One is to take them into account the restrictions between the "us" and "other" and the second strategy is to deny and exclude (—spit!) them by establishing strong boundaries and higher institutions that remain inaccessible. These strategies can be done experimentally in many situations. Finally, Levinas (1979) establishes his moral philosophy on confrontational encounters with other human beings rather than relying on abstract ethical rules and takes the moment of this instance with others.

Said's influential work "Orientalism" delves into the construction of Western representations of the "Orient" and their utilization in legitimizing colonial dominance. This study's objective is to uncover the power dynamics and cultural stereotypes interwoven within the portrayal of Muslim culture during

the colonial era (Said, 1978). Said (1985; 1994), in “Orientalism” and in “Culture and Imperialism” found that Western identity and culture were essentially forged by the logic of Othering one that degrades “Other” as primitive, black, uncivilized, non-believers, oriental, female, etc. The basic trait of otherness is to reject others in their own voice, deny the possibility of speaking for themselves, and instead attribute qualities, opinions, and perspectives related to their own culture and identity. In these pessimistic views, the other is directly or indirectly starved of any power to human rights as the transmitter of miasma and pollution. It is for this cause that the Other is frequently referred to with numerous metaphors denoting containment, impurity, and sub-humanness, 'virus', 'leeches', 'pest', 'swamp', 'vermin' etc. The existence of this dehumanized Other commonly is indicated with metaphors of invasion and infection, such as 'marauding', 'swamped', 'inundation', and 'swarms'.

Spivak (1985) was the first person to practice the concept of otherness in an efficient way. Spivak used this concept in Derrida's evaluation as early as 1980, but it wasn't until 1985 that it was systematically used in her essay, “The Rani of Sirmur”.

This study centers on the exploration of Orientalism and its implications for the dynamics between “self” and “other”. The concept of “Otherness” has often been examined through the lens of general orientalist practices. Echoing the binaries of “us” and “them,” Edward W. Said (1978) contends that in perpetuating the inevitable chasm between these two groups, the dominant “us” perpetuates a sense of superiority. This self-assumed superiority bestows upon them the authority to dominate, oppress, and, in various ways, colonize the “them,” maintaining precise governance and control. Said discerns that while the term “Others” is mentioned and represented, it is persistently excluded and silenced. Within this framework, the researcher investigates the circumstances that lead to their marginalized status and explores their adaptive strategies for survival. The primary focus lies in understanding the attitudes directed toward transgender communities as marginalized groups within the novel, those systematically pushed to the periphery of mainstream society in ways that defy simple explanations. Anjum, a transgender woman, grapples with societal prejudice, highlighting the challenges faced by transgender individuals and responding by establishing a unique community.

Numerous facets of this novel have been subject to exploration. Despite its recent publication, extensive analysis has been conducted on this literary work. Diverse scholars have embarked on journeys of uncovering the novel's multifaceted nature. However, there exists a relative dearth of research pertaining to Edward Said's theoretical framework of “self” and “other.” This research paper introduces a novel perspective to the interpretation of this literary piece, contributing a fresh dimension to the main character Anjum. The paper undertakes a critical evaluation of existing reviews while also addressing gaps in the current discourse. Furthermore, it facilitates an examination of how Arundhati Roy skillfully interweaves contemporary social and political issues into the narrative, offering a platform for the transgender community as a marginalized to voice their experiences.

3. RESEARCH METHODS

The research employs a qualitative approach, according to the definition, focusing on the “meanings, concepts, definitions, characteristics, metaphors, symbols, and description of things” (Lune & Berg, 2017). This qualitative method allows for a more intimate and equitable interaction between the researcher and the researched, aligning with the emphasis made by (Stanley, 2013). Primary data for this research are collected from selected passages of the novel *The Ministry of Utmost Happiness* through textual analysis, a method highlighted by Caulfield (2023) as one that aims to connect the text to broader social, political, cultural, or artistic contexts. “Textual analysis is a broad term for various research methods used to describe, interpret and understand texts. All kinds of information can be gleaned from a text – from its literal meaning to the subtext, symbolism, assumptions, and values it

reveals.” (Caulfield, 2023). The methods used to conduct textual analysis depend on the field and the aims of the research. It often aims to connect the text to a broader social, political, cultural, or artistic context. Secondary data are gathered from various sources such as research articles, web journals, research papers, opinions, and writings from different authors and critics addressing the research problem at hand.

It's important to note that only the English version of the novel is analyzed in this study, and no translated versions are included in the analysis. The primary goal of data analysis is the acquisition of relevant insights. Through a meticulous examination of the text, the researcher grapples with the challenge of uncovering the suppression of fundamental instincts and aspirations among marginalized individuals. These lives are often marked by enduring societal suffering. Furthermore, the analysis explores how these marginalized individuals, despite enduring othering, suffering, and humiliation, manage to discover avenues for cultivating their own happiness and extending this sense of empowerment to others who share similar experiences.

4. ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION

In Arundhati Roy's "The Ministry of Utmost Happiness," the narrative unfolds within the complex tapestry of a society marked by the existence of multiple individuals designated as the "Other." Roy's deliberate and strategic use of both content and form serves as a powerful counterbalance to prevailing expectations and prejudices. This nuanced approach allows her to effectively portray the diverse stories of characters labeled as the "Other," while simultaneously acknowledging and embracing their differences and otherness. As the novel grapples with the struggles faced by marginalized groups such as women, transgender individuals, "apostates," and ethnic minorities, it delves into the denigration, marginalization, and oppression experienced on a global scale. Drawing inspiration from Said's theory of Orientalism, this analysis aims to explore how "The Ministry of Utmost Happiness" addresses the crises of its characters and depicts social injustices, illuminating the tensions arising from differences and societal disparities.

4.1 Stigmatizing Experiences of the Character “Anjum” in the Ministry of Utmost Happiness

Anjum's Arrival in the Graveyard

Anjum, a transgender woman, a central character introduced within the novel, has taken up residence in a graveyard situated behind a government hospital. In the early months of her stay, she grapples with the challenges of coexisting alongside junkies and homeless individuals. She faces a significant amount of scorn from the other denizens of the graveyard, who mockingly label her as a "clown without a circus, queen without a palace" (Roy, 2017, p. 3), but when she made an elderly blind Imam named Ziauddin her friend, others in the graveyard left her alone. The names used by graveyard residents to make fun of Anjum underscore her position in society. With the plot moving readers grasp the magnitude of alienation that Anjum is facing at the hands of society. During the conversation between Anjum and Imam, the reader notices that Anjum clearly belongs to transgender community that is specifically excluded from traditional norms and customs. Hindus are traditionally not cremated, so the Imam's assertion that "even the Hindus among you." (Roy, 2017, p. 6). People like Anjum are not cremated and inform readers that she fits into a group of people who are not supposed to deserve even the traditional transit ritual from this world.

Anjum, a transgender woman, initially faces scorn and mockery in the graveyard where she resides. The residents label her as a "clown without a circus, queen without a palace," emphasizing her marginalized status. However, her friendship with an elderly blind Imam named Ziauddin provides her some reprieve from societal disdain. Anjum's introduction highlights the immediate challenges and

stigmatization she faces as a transgender individual. Her connection with Imam Ziauddin signifies the potential for understanding and acceptance even in the face of societal prejudices.

4.2 Jahanara's Struggle with Aftab's Tran Sexuality

After the mysterious and othered presentation of Anjum 's identity, the plot finally moves to reveal more about her. Anjum holds the fourth position among five siblings, the initial three being females. During Anjum's birth, the midwife presents her to her mother as a male child, sparking immense joy in Jahanara Begum, who had nurtured the desire for a son and had already settled on the name "Aftab." Nevertheless, as the sun graces the day following Aftab's birth, Jahanara picks up her infant son, only to be confronted with an inescapable and harsh revelation regarding his transsexuality. "The next morning, when the sun was up and the room nice and warm, she unwaddled little Aftab. She explored his tiny body – eyes nose head neck armpits fingers toes – with sated, unhurried delight. That was when she discovered, nestling underneath his boy-parts, a small, unformed, but undoubtedly girl-part. Is it possible for a mother to be terrified of her own baby? Jahanara Begum was. Her Mother first reaction was to feel her heart constrict and her bones turn to ash. Her second reaction was to take another look to make sure she was not mistaken. Her third reaction was to recoil from what she had created while her bowels convulsed and a thin stream of shit ran down her legs. Her fourth reaction was to contemplate killing herself and her child. Her fifth reaction was to pick her baby up and hold him close while she fell through a crack between the world she knew and worlds she did not know existed." (Roy, 2017, p. 7, 8).

Jahanara's strong desire for a son highlights the significant degree of male gender preference prevailing in her society. Furthermore, Jahanara is so traumatized, when she sees her son as intersex that she intends to commit suicide and kill her baby too. When she realizes that Aftab is intersex, her whims of killing the baby herself reveal the stigmatization, discrimination, and exorbitant intolerance prevailing in her community. She thought that having a child who is and always will be unable to fit into the unendurably stigmatized and strict gender categories is better than not having that child at all. Eventually, Jahanara decides to hide her baby's gender. However, she decides to take the little Aftab to the holy place. Normally, she doesn't go to this specific shrine, but in this particular context, she senses a strong designation to that shrine in this situation. "perhaps she was drawn to the strange people she had seen camped there when she used to walk past on her way to Meena Bazaar, the kind of people who in her earlier life she would not have deigned to even glance at unless they 'd crossed her path. Suddenly they seemed to be the most important people in the world." (Roy, 2017, p. 9). Individuals she previously considered unworthy of attention suddenly become the most significant figures in her world. At this moment, Jahanara's decision to visit the shrine holds great significance. Roy suggests that shrine visitors belong to an othered and socially marginalized group, as evidenced by her description of them as a kind that Jahanara typically avoids acknowledging. Jahanara's swift shift in perspective, viewing them as "the most important people in the world," indicates that Aftab's birth has already begun to alter her relationship with the societal hierarchy. She sees her son as one of them and is now more attracted to the exiles of society. It's noticeable that Jahanara wants Aftab to be traditionally masculine above all else, but as Aftab develops his behavioral instincts and enthusiasm for singing, his feminine nature rather than masculine one has been revealed.

Jahanara's initial joy at the birth of what she thinks is a son turns to despair upon discovering Aftab's intersex identity. The narrative portrays the deep-seated male gender preference in society and Jahanara's extreme reactions, including contemplating suicide. This section underscores the societal pressure for traditional gender roles and the severe consequences of deviating from these norms. Jahanara's struggles reflect the broader issues of gender expectations and discrimination.

4.3 Aftab's Early Years and Influences

Jahanara reached a pivotal juncture in her life when concealing Aftab's gender reality became untenable, compelling her to confide in her husband, her long-endured companion in suffering. Upon learning the shattering truth, Mulaqat (father of Aftab) concluded that he and his wife needed to consult Dr. Ghulam Nabi, a "sexologist," regarding Aftab's situation. Dr. Nabi's determination was that Aftab did not technically fall under the category of Hijra, a term of paramount importance throughout the novel. Dr. Nabi's elucidation of Hijra is as follows: "a female trapped in a male body" (Roy, 2017, p.16). Yet, as the narrative progresses, this conventional understanding of gender continually faces challenges.

Mulaqat resolved that Aftab should undergo gender-affirming surgery and, in the interim, endeavored to share stories of his Mongol ancestors with him, while also amassing funds for his son's surgical procedure. "Simultaneously, he embarked on the cultural project of inculcating manliness in Aftab. He passed on to him his love of poetry and discouraged the singing of Thumri and Chaiti (Expressive genres of North Indian semi-classical music, capturing love, devotion, and the essence of spring through emotive vocals and melodic compositions). He stayed up late into the night, telling Aftab stories about their warrior ancestors and their valor on the battlefield. They left Aftab unmoved. But when he heard the story of how Temujin – Changez Khan – won the hand of his beautiful wife, Borte Khatun, how she was kidnapped by a rival tribe, and how Temujin fought a whole army virtually single-handedly to get her back because he loved her so much, Aftab found himself wanting to be her." (Roy, 2017, p.17). Mulaqat's primary endeavor was to instill a sense of masculinity in Aftab, attempting to persuade his son of the advantages associated with a male identity as opposed to a feminine one and trying to kill othered existence within his son but Aftab's desire to be a warrior queen underscores her true gender identity regardless of his father's stigmatized practices. "While Aftab's siblings all go to school, Aftab stays at home, observing the neighborhood. One day he sees a tall, thin woman—wearing bright lipstick, gold high heels and a shiny, green satin 'salwar kameez' and, again, wants to be her. Aftab follows the fascinating woman all the way down the street until she enters a house with a blue doorway. He is intrigued by her in part because he knows that if she was really a woman, she wouldn't have been allowed to dress that way—she would have had to wear a burqa or at the very least a head covering. Aftab longs to be her, to have her graceful walk and stylish clothing—for—it was not Aftab's girlpart that was an appendage." (Roy, 2017). Aftab's contemplation that a cis-gendered woman like her would not have the freedom to dress as she desires challenges the reader's perception of Hijras as solely marginalized, stigmatized, oppressed, and discriminated against. This perspective sheds light on the fact that Hijras, in certain contexts, hold more power and agency than cis-gendered women, allowing them greater opportunities for self-expression. Thus, the margins of society are not exclusively sites of injustice and oppression; they also serve as spaces of empowerment. Aftab's upbringing involves conflicting efforts by Mulaqat Ali to instill masculinity. Despite these attempts, Aftab's inclination towards a feminine identity becomes evident. The narrative challenges stereotypes as Aftab admires a cis-gendered woman who defies societal expectations Aftab's journey complicates the notion of fixed gender roles, highlighting the fluidity of identity. The contrast between societal expectations and personal identity is vividly portrayed.

4.4 Anjum's Life in the Khwabgah

Aftab often spends extended periods outside a building referred to as the "*khwabgah*," which translates to "dream house." The *khwabgah* carries multiple layers of significance within the narrative. Firstly, it symbolizes a realm of Aftab's aspirations, a space previously unknown to her, where she can express her identity freely—something she had never envisioned to be possible in her acknowledged reality. Secondly, the term "*khwabgah*" is laden with distinct connotations and serves as a representation

of divergence from other spaces in the story. *Khwabgah* stands apart from mainstream society, existing almost as a parallel universe—a dreamlike world for individuals deemed unconventional and alien in the eyes of the so-called normative society.

Nimmo, a member of the *khwabgah*, holds a contrasting perspective on Hijra identity compared to Aftab. While Aftab finds beauty, elegance, charm, and loveliness in the expressions of the *khwabgah* residents, Nimmo perceives herself and her fellow community members as categorized individuals deprived of the capacity for happiness. Their marginalized identities render them incomprehensible to mainstream society. According to Nimmo, being a Hijra parallels the internal conflict of the India-Pakistan divide. She asserts, "for Hijras; 'The riot is inside us. The war is inside us. Indo-Pak is inside us. It will never settle down. It can't'" (Roy, 2017, p. 23). For Nimmo, the challenges Hijras face do not solely stem from society's stigmatization but from an inner turmoil between their male and female identities.

Aftab's initially optimistic view of the *khwabgah* and Hijra life reflects his naiveté. However, as his body begins to behave in ways that contradict his gender identity, he starts to grasp the depth of Nimmo's internal struggle. This realization prompts him to acknowledge her profound conflict. His decision to distance himself from the conventional world of "*Duniya*" signifies his full acceptance of his marginalized identity. He embraces both the challenges and joys that come with this experience, embodying a profound acceptance of himself as a marginalized individual.

Aftab's decision to live in the *khwabgah* and leave his own home stands in contrast to Jahanara's unwavering devotion to her son, highlighting the stark difference in acceptance between them. This is in contrast to Mulaqat Ali, who resists acknowledging Anjum. Jahanara's example underscores how embracing social differences can lead to greater social connections, whereas Mulaqat's adherence to societal norms isolates him from his own child.

As Aftab transforms into Anjum, she becomes the most renowned Hijra. Journalists and NGOs covet her story, often assuming that her traditional Muslim family mistreated her. However, they are surprised to learn that her parents deeply loved her, and she herself had been the one to display cruelty toward them. In the *khwabgah*, Anjum is able to freely express her desired appearance. She adorns herself with feminine attire, pierces her nose, styles her short hair into braids with extensions, and wears elaborate dresses. The *khwabgah* becomes a metaphor for embracing one's authentic self, challenging societal norms. The internal conflict among Hijras mirrors broader societal divisions, providing a nuanced portrayal of marginalized identities.

4.5 Anjum's Transformation and Ambiguity

Anjum's decision to undergo gender-affirming surgery with Dr. Mukhtar, who has treated many *khwabgah* residents before, results in physical changes, but the unexpected alteration in her voice introduces ambiguity. The narrative explores Anjum's struggle with societal expectations and her desire for a conventional life. On Anjum's 18th birthday, Kulsoom Bi throws a celebration for her. That night, Anjum dreams of being a new bride on her wedding night and experiences an orgasm in her sleep. When she awakens, she dons a new red sari. Troubled by her experience, Anjum confides in Kulsoom Bi. She comforts Anjum, describing Hijras as vessels inhabited by "a Holy Soul." Encouraged by Kulsoom Bi, Anjum contemplates undergoing gender-transition surgery, as she's assured that such a decision isn't against Islamic beliefs. Kulsoom Bi's optimistic and affirmative portrayal of the Hijra identity stands in stark contrast to Nimmo's analogy of the internal conflict between India and Pakistan that she shared with Anjum. Kulsoom Bi's perspective reflects a celebration of the Hijra identity, rooted even in her Muslim faith. Her need to reassure Anjum that surgery aligns with Islam highlights the

existence of doubts within their community. Kulsoom Bi has shaped her interpretation of faith to be all-encompassing, embracing the diversity within her community rather than excluding any part of it.

The removal of her penis brings about a significant improvement in her physical well-being. Additionally, Dr. Mukhtar provides Anjum with tablets that modulate her voice. This modification, however, results in a peculiar and raspy quality, often resembling a dialogue between two conflicting voices rather than a single one. "that undeeen her voice but also give it a peculiar, rasping quality, which sometimes sounded like two voices quarreling with each other instead of one." (Roy, 2017, p. 29). In her transformed state, characterized by her "patched up body parts" (Roy, 2017, p. 29) and the medication altering her voice to sound like "two voices quarreling with each other instead of one" (Roy, 2017, p. 29), the notion that Hijras experience their own internal version of the India-Pakistan conflict is further emphasized. This inner conflict is a perpetual battle within themselves. Anjum's initial aim with the surgery was to achieve a feminine appearance and experience, yet the unexpected effect of the pills on her voice places her in a state of ambiguity, residing between various worlds and identities. As a result, she is now unfit to fit into any particular category of this world. Anjum lived for 30 years in the khwabgah then she left her dream world to make a new world.

Anjum grapples with her aspiration to lead a conventional life in the "Duniya," yet she ponders whether such a life is "reasonable on the part of someone like herself" (Roy, 2017, p. 30). This suggests that Anjum's decision to exist beyond the confines of the Duniya is not solely a rejection of reality, but also a response to the rejection of her very existence. Zainab holds a special place in Anjum's heart, whom she encounters on the steps of a mosque one day, a forsaken child. Anjum's profound connection to Zainab stems from the fact that, unlike everyone else, the Baby doesn't deny her or consider Anjum to be strange even after facing being rejected by her family at such a young age. It is because she wasn't exposed to the rasping norms and rules of normalizing or de-normalizing yet.

"The warring factions inside Anjum fell silent. Her body felt like a generous host instead of a battlefield. Was it like dying, or being born? Anjum couldn't decide. In her imagination it had the fullness, the sense of entirety, of one of the two. She bent down and picked the Mouse [baby] up and cradled her in her arms, murmuring all the while to her in both her quarrelling voices." (Roy, 2017, p. 30). From the passage, readers can observe the acceptance of two othered bodies to each other and becoming a source of smoothness in the battlefield of identities and that Anjum desires to help others, but she fears that, because of her Hijra identity, they will reject her help and will question her very existence. Anjum's transformation highlights the complexities of identity and the challenges faced by those who exist between societal categories. The unexpected consequences of surgery symbolize the ongoing internal conflicts within Anjum.

4.6 Anjum's Relationship with Zainab and 9/11 Impact

Moving forward, Anjum exposes certain aspects of her alienated existence in the novel. Her inclination to reveal her life's truths to Zainab, even though the child is too young to fully grasp them, signifies her longing to be acknowledged, recognized, and comprehended for her authentic self. Paradoxically, despite being surrounded by individuals who share her identity, she remains misunderstood by her peers who share her experiences. This desire to communicate her feelings might stem from her lack of close familial bonds and understanding, prompting her to establish a close relationship with her newfound child. Her belief that Zainab can navigate the harsh realities of violence mirrors her own childhood experiences, which extended beyond the typical challenges faced by a child of her gender. "After 9/11 —Every day Anjum, new to the news, watched TV reports about bomb blasts and terrorist attacks that suddenly proliferated like malaria. The Urdu papers carried stories of young Muslim boys being killed in what the police called 'encounters', or being caught red-handed in the act

of planning terrorist strikes and arrested. A new law was passed that allowed suspects to be detained without trial for months. In no time at all the prisons were full of young Muslim men. Anjum thanked the Almighty that Zainab was a girl. It was so much safer". (Roy, 2017).

Anjum's appreciation for Zainab being a girl is another instance in the narrative that challenges societal stereotypes regarding the superiority of males over females. Meanwhile, Zainab's health deteriorates, prompting Anjum to seek guidance from a Muslim religious leader, who advises her to visit the Hazrat Gharib Nawaz shrine in Ajmer. Consequently, Anjum decides to accompany Zakir Mian until Zainab's condition improves. Zakir Mian is an old friend of her father, and he is "too old to be embarrassed about being seen traveling with a Hijra" (Roy, 2017, p. 43). He suggests that they visit the shrine of the Urdu poet Wali Dakhani, someone cherished by Mulaqat. Anjum's relationship with Zainab reveals her yearning for familial bonds and acceptance. The narrative critiques societal biases during times of political unrest, emphasizing the intersectionality of identities.

4.7 Exploitation of the Character “Anjum” in the Ministry of Utmost Happiness

As the political right gains influence in her country, Anjum, the resilient Hijra (transgender), becomes a poignant symbol of vulnerability and rebellion. In an intimate moment outdoors with Saddam and Biroo, their loyal companion, Anjum shares the cherished *"Flyover Story,"* leading to an unexpected revelation that she was *"born to be a mother"* (Roy, 2017). This revelation becomes a vulnerable confession, shaping Anjum's defiance against societal norms and expectations. Yet, the feasibility of such a role is immediately questioned by Saddam, who pragmatically introduces the element of "Reality." Frustrated by his realism, Anjum challenges him, asserting that once individuals fall from societal grace, they continue to descend while supporting others in their shared descent. The profound declaration, *"We don't really exist,"* (Roy, 2017) becomes the core of Anjum's philosophy, unraveling the exploitation she endures and the rebellion that defines her involvement with Funeral Services and the creation of the Jannat Guest House.

Positioning herself as detached from the norms of the Duniya and conventional society, Anjum boldly claims to have already "fallen" beyond the boundaries of conformity. The term "fall" carries poignant undertones, implying not a descent into oblivion but a deliberate divergence—a "failure to conform" to societal expectations. Anjum's self-characterization becomes an act of rebellion against the limitations imposed by a conformist society, a reclamation of agency in defining her identity. In the face of Saddam Hussain's narrow assumptions about her potential for motherhood, Anjum defiantly suggests that her rejection of societal norms should not restrict her maternal aspirations. This exchange becomes a poignant moment of resistance, challenging the restrictive confines of societal expectations and highlighting the exploitation embedded within those expectations. As Anjum and Saddam return indoors, their shared feeling of detachment, described as being "a pair of astronauts," (Roy, 2017) symbolizes their profound disconnection from the real world and the societal norms that govern it.

4.8 Character “Anjum” Discriminative Experiences in The Ministry of Utmost Happiness

The struggle between the poor and the government causes the city to break out of tension in the novel, in what is supposed to be its "renewal" summer. "Scores of young reporters roam the streets of the city; they were asking urgent, empty questions; they asked the poor what it was like to be poor, the hungry what it was like to be hungry, the homeless what it was like to be homeless. *'Bhai Sahib, yeh bataaiye, aap ko kaisa lag rahahai ...? 'Tell me, brother, how it feels to be ...?'*" (Roy, 2017, p. 99). In this passage, Roy's ridicule of young journalists is the beginning of a serious criticism of the role of the media in exploitation and discrimination. It is evident at this moment that the reporters have no sincere interest in helping the poor; instead, they continue to explore their narratives of struggle and

hunger in order to maximize audience attendance. This kind of journalism is melodramatic and can do little to minimize the hardships of the individuals covered in the stories. In this tumultuous "renewal" summer, Roy sharply criticizes the media's exploitative role, as young journalists, devoid of genuine empathy, perpetuate narratives of poverty and hunger for sensationalism. Anjum's presence at the protest signifies a stark contrast between genuine activism and opportunistic posturing. The filmmakers' lack of interest in understanding Anjum's perspective highlights the shallowness of their documentary, exposing the superficiality of those exploiting the struggles of the marginalized.

Anjum, Saddam Hussain, Ustad Hameed, Nimmo, and their companion Ishrat, a visiting Hijra from Indore, saw a protest and went to support the poor at the protest sight where dishonest politicians were staging the hunger strike only for their beneficial sake and where everyone is trying to take advantage of the situation and circumstances of others at the same sight. Nimmo has derived all of them to the site that Saddam thinks is one huge scam, but Anjum insists they're going to learn something. She is insistent on the prospect of sending Saddam from activist to activist to collect data on what is being protested and why. Ustad Hameed, meanwhile, has no interest in what's being talked about, and young Ishrat spends the whole time taking selfies. At one point, a couple of filmmakers making an anticorruption documentary are filming protesters saying on camera, "Another world is possible." Instead of saying this, Anjum says, "We've come from there... from the other world". (Roy,2017, p. 110). The filmmakers didn't bother to find out what Anjum was saying because they didn't know what this meant and they only filmed the favorable situations for their documentary which will be according to their understanding and perception. In this moment, the filmmakers 'lack of interest in understanding what Anjum really means to say is an indication of their own shallowness, their lack of honest interest in the reasons being protested. In trying to convince everyone to say; "Another World Is Possible" in whatever language they spoke. For example, if their mother tongue was Hindi or Urdu, they could say, 'Doosri duniya mumkin hai ... 'They set up their camera while they were talking and asked Anjum to look straight into the lens when she spoke. They had no idea what Duniya meant in Anjum 's lexicon. Anjum, for her part, completely uncomprehending, stared into the camera. 'Hum doosriDuniya se aayehain, 'she explained helpfully, which meant: We 've come from there ... from the other world'. (Roy,2017, p.110).

As Anjum says that she and her group have come from "the other world," readers understand that the documentarians are asking their audiences to imagine the sense that she has come from the greater, varied world. This is true in a way: Anjum comes from a narrow society where the caste system, corruption, and other kinds of injustice are literally non-issues. At the sight of the protest, the promoters of *Gujarat ka Lalla* (the colloquial term for the then-Chief Minister of Gujarat) were telling the mothers that "Muslim terrorists do not deserve human rights" (Roy,2017, p.115). At this point, the followers of Gujarat ka Lalla let their non-extremist masks slip a little bit when they announce, fundamentally, that there are no human rights for Muslims. It is utterly ridiculous to withhold human rights from any group of people, but since Muslims have been so dehumanized in the eyes of the religious rights of India, the followers of Gujarat ka Lalla are unable to see how absurd this assertion is. The fact that at an event that is meant to be a protest against various injustices, Anjum suffers injustice suggests that she is so excluded from society that even there she is not considered deserving of expression.

At the end of the novel Anjum has succeeded in building a powerful community around Jannat Guest House and Funeral Services and her achievement shines through it can be seen when in the novel so many people assembled to welcome a complete stranger in the middle of the night it shows the depth of their promise to hold each other and to survive together.

Roy introduces readers to the severe discrimination and class deprivation in which Delhi's people live by explaining Ishrat and Saddam's journey through the city. The amazement of Ishrat that people have driveways for "gardens for their cars" suggests that she thinks it is needless to have such a vast amount of room. The affluent luxury neighborhoods contrast greatly with the public hospitals mentioned by Roy, which do not even have ample room for all of their patients, while some people have "gardens" for their vehicles. The fact that patients need to procure unofficial copies of the prescription indicates their apparent lack of financial privilege.

4.9 Anjum's Tapestry of Otherness: A Comparative Exploration with Tilo, Saddam Hussiam and Rubina

In this nuanced analysis, we delve into Anjum's narrative, weaving a rich tapestry that draws comparisons with the experiences of Tilo. Each character, in their unique way, grapples with the complexities of otherness and societal marginalization. Anjum, a resilient Hijra, builds a sanctuary at Jannat Guest House, carving out her space on the fringes of society. Drawing parallels with Tilo, the illegitimate daughter of a Christian mother and Dalit father, we unravel the common threads of dissent against societal norms. The title encapsulates the essence of this analysis, inviting readers to explore the intersections and distinctions in the lives of Anjum and Tilo as they navigate the labyrinth of societal expectations and carve out their identities amidst adversity.

Tilo was the Untouchable child of an untouchable father and a Syrian Christian mother. Her mother, to cover her sin, gave her new baby girl to an orphanage and then went back and adopted her. Tilo emerges as a passionate freedom fighter of Kashmir. Being deprived of the important requirements of life like home, proper upbringing, and parents, she turns to be rebellious against the established norms of society. Casteism and racial discrimination are also very much prevalent in Tilo 's story who is "the Other", an unusual, rambling woman and the protagonist of the second section of the novel. Tilo 's effort to resist the established authority can be traced to her own terrible history. Tilo has strong ideological and physical relations with Kashmiri freedom fighter Musa Yeswi. She also adopted a baby girl, who was born in Central Indian jungles to another resistance fighter Revathy. Her name was Miss Jabeen the Second, illegitimate daughter of Revathy. Tilo being the daughter of a Christian mother and a Dalit father is another "Other" in Indian society, who dissents against the social elimination of Christian and Dalit-born Indians and shows struggle and resistance through her antinormative character.

The remaining stories in the book focus on detailing occasions of corruption and violence on behalf of predominantly the Indian army, and also local militant groups in Kashmir. Innocent civilians are shot by unknown gunmen, framed for murder, jailed, and tortured by police. An entry titled Khadija says, "Reads simply, In Kashmir when we wake up and say Good Morning 'what we really mean is Good Mourning". (Roy, 2017, p. 279). The penultimate entry, titled nothing, written by Tilo in the first person, reads; "I would like to write one of those sophisticated stories in which even though nothing much happens there's lots to write about. That can't be done in Kashmir. It's not sophisticated, what happens here. There's too much blood for good literature". (Roy, 2017, p. 283). Tilo's interpretation of the story she told about Kashmir seems to be Roy's delicately veiled comment on the meaning of her whole book. *The Ministry of Utmost Happiness*, like Tilo's Reader's Digest, attempts to tell a tale in which there is so much killing, violence, desperation, and confusion that it will be difficult for it to be a sophisticated story "in which nothing happens." This, in turn, challenges the lack of action as a criterion for good literature for, if this is the case, only literature about subjects that are less urgent than the egregious violence faced in many parts of the world can be considered "good".

Tilo herself couldn't be happier to leave the real world behind, where she has always been an outcast, alien, and outsider, though Anjum believes that Tilo would like a space that is close to one she

will find in Duniya. The fact that she feels at home at Jannat means that inside, she is as distinct as Anjum from conventional society. In the eyes of conventional Indian society, the comparison between Kashmir and Jannat Guest House and Funeral Services derives from the fact that all these locations are marginalized and oppressed in mainstream society but somehow survive in their own finest ways.

In parallel to Tilo's intricate narrative, Anjum's experiences in "The Ministry of Utmost Happiness" add another layer to Arundhati Roy's exploration of marginalized identities and spaces in Indian society. While Tilo's life is entwined with the Kashmiri struggle for freedom, Anjum, as a transgender woman, embodies a different facet of societal Otherness. Anjum's character, with her unique journey from a graveyard to establishing the Jannat Guest House and Funeral Services, mirrors Tilo's quest for unconventional spaces. Tilo's connection with Musa Yeswi finds a counterpart in Anjum's experiences, both navigating a society that often views them as outsiders. The adoption of Miss Jabeen the Second by Tilo and Anjum's endeavor to create a haven for the marginalized highlight their shared commitment to embracing those deemed societal Others. The pervasive corruption and violence detailed in Tilo's entries resonate in Anjum's world as well. The struggles faced by innocent civilians in Kashmir parallel the challenges encountered by Anjum and her community. Anjum's unique perspective provides an alternative lens through which to view the violence and desperation inherent in Tilo's narrative, further amplifying Roy's commentary on the harsh realities faced by those on the fringes of society. Just as Tilo challenges conventional notions of good literature by presenting a tale saturated with urgency and violence, Anjum, too, disrupts societal norms by carving out a space for herself and others in the Jannat Guest House. The comparison between Tilo and Anjum becomes a powerful lens through which to examine the varied ways in which individuals dissent against social norms and navigate their distinct forms of Otherness. In the eyes of conventional Indian society, the parallel experiences of Tilo and Anjum underscore the broader theme of survival amid oppression. Their distinct but interconnected narratives symbolize the resilience of marginalized individuals and the unconventional spaces they create to find solace and identity in a society that often marginalizes them.

The depiction of Anjum, the resilient Hijra, in "The Ministry of Utmost Happiness," intricately aligns with Edward Said's theory of Orientalism, providing a lens through which to understand the dynamics of representation and marginalization. The initial section of the analysis sheds light on Anjum's vulnerability and rebellion as the political right gains influence. This vulnerability becomes a poignant symbol of the exploitation and discrimination faced by the transgender community. Anjum's revelation about being "born to be a mother" becomes a pivotal moment that challenges societal norms and expectations, setting the stage for a nuanced exploration of her defiance against the mainstream narrative. Anjum's confrontations with societal norms and her self-characterization as someone who has deliberately "fallen" beyond the boundaries of conformity. This act of deliberate divergence becomes a powerful form of rebellion against the limitations imposed by a conformist society. The shared feeling of detachment between Anjum and Saddam symbolizes their profound disconnection from societal norms, emphasizing the exploitation embedded within those expectations. The discriminative experiences faced by the transgender community in the novel. It critiques the role of the media in perpetuating exploitation and discrimination, drawing attention to Anjum's active participation in protests and the superficiality of those exploiting the struggles of the marginalized. Anjum's declaration that "We've come from there... from the other world" underscores the alienation experienced by the transgender community, even in spaces meant for protest against injustices. The creation of the Jannat Guest House and Funeral Services as a powerful act of resistance and community-building. Anjum's success in assembling a powerful community highlights the depth of their promise to hold each other and survive together. The analysis underscores how Anjum's narrative parallels the broader theme of survival amid oppression, resonating with the marginalized identities explored by Said in his critique

of Orientalism. The comparative exploration with Tilo, emphasizing how both characters grapple with the complexities of otherness and societal marginalization. Tilo's story, intertwined with the Kashmiri struggle for freedom, aligns with Anjum's experiences, creating a rich tapestry that invites readers to explore the intersections and distinctions in their lives.

Bringing these sections of analysis together, the portrayal of the transgender community in the novel becomes a microcosm of the broader Orientalist discourse. Anjum's journey, from vulnerability to resilience, challenges the predetermined roles imposed by the mainstream community, reflecting the power dynamics inherent in the Orientalist perspective. The creation of alternative spaces, such as the Jannat Guest House, becomes a form of resistance against the Orientalist gaze that seeks to confine the transgender community within narrow boundaries. In essence, "The Ministry of Utmost Happiness" serves as a compelling narrative that not only depicts the struggles and triumphs of the transgender community but also invites readers to critically engage with the Orientalist perspective embedded in societal structures. Anjum's defiance, resilience, and community-building efforts urge a reevaluation of societal norms, fostering a more inclusive understanding of identity and belonging. Through this analysis, the novel prompts a nuanced exploration of how marginalized groups resist, find spaces for themselves, and challenge the mainstream narrative, offering a powerful commentary on the intersections of literature, identity, and societal expectations.

5. CONCLUSION

The analysis of "The Ministry of Utmost Happiness" through the lens of Orientalism reveals profound insights into the stigmatization, exploitation, and discrimination faced by the main character, Anjum, as the "Other" existing at the periphery of society. Anjum's journey serves as a microcosm of the broader Orientalist discourse, unraveling the power dynamics and societal norms that perpetuate the marginalization of transgender individuals.

The first research question explored Anjum's experiences of being stigmatized, exploited, and discriminated against by those at the center of society. Through Anjum's vulnerability and resilience, the novel vividly illustrates the oppressive forces that seek to confine individuals like her within predefined societal roles. Anjum's revelation about being "born to be a mother" becomes a poignant moment of defiance, challenging the normative expectations and sparking a nuanced exploration of her identity. The shared feeling of detachment between Anjum and others, symbolized by being "astronauts" in their own right, underscores the profound disconnection from societal norms and the exploitation embedded within those expectations.

The second research question delved into how Anjum, as an "Other," goes against customs, tests new ways of life, carves new spaces, and experiments with new roles in the society depicted in the novel. Anjum's deliberate divergence from societal norms becomes an act of rebellion, reclaiming agency in defining her identity beyond the limitations imposed by a conformist society. The creation of the Jannat Guest House and Funeral Services stands as a powerful testament to Anjum's resistance, demonstrating her commitment to building alternative spaces for marginalized individuals. Anjum's success in assembling a powerful community around these spaces highlights the transformative potential of dissent and the ability to survive and thrive on the fringes of society.

Through the perspective of Orientalism, the novel guides readers to critically engage with the power structures embedded in societal norms. Anjum's defiance challenges the Orientalist gaze that seeks to confine the transgender community within narrow boundaries, urging a reevaluation of established norms. The novel, through Anjum's narrative, encourages readers to question and dismantle the oppressive forces that perpetuate discrimination against the "Other." "The Ministry of Utmost Happiness" serves as a compelling exploration of identity, resistance, and survival amid societal

expectations. Anjum's journey, framed within the Orientalist perspective, becomes a guide for readers to navigate the complexities of societal norms, advocating for inclusivity, and emphasizing the importance of carving out alternative spaces for those marginalized at the periphery of society. Through Anjum's narrative, the novel challenges readers to reconsider their own perspectives, fostering a deeper understanding of the diverse ways individuals resist, create, and thrive in the face of societal expectations.

This research underscores the significance of employing the theoretical framework of Otherness to dissect Aujum's narrative. Aujum's portrayal as a transgender individual allows for an in-depth analysis of the layers of discrimination faced by the community. The limitations of this study lie in its focus on Aujum; however, the applicability of the Otherness framework can be extended to other characters in Roy's body of work. Future research could explore how Aujum's Otherness theory applies to characters beyond Tilo, offering a comprehensive understanding of marginalized voices in Roy's literary realm. As we navigate the complexities of Aujum's journey, we unearth broader insights into the pervasive nature of othering in contemporary society. The limitations of this study lie in its focus on a single character, and future research could expand this framework to encompass a broader spectrum of characters within Roy's works. The significance of this analysis lies in its ability to provide an in-depth understanding of the complexities of Otherness, offering a theoretical lens that can be applied to unravel the narratives of other characters in Roy's literary repertoire.

Author contributions: Urooj Babar and Shehryar Ahmed have equally contributed to the preparation/drafting of this paper.

Ethical Statement: Not Applicable

Consent to Participate: N/A

Competing Interests: The author declares that this work has no competing interests.

Grant/Funding information: The author declared that no grants supported this work.

Data Availability Statement: Not Applicable.

Declaration Statement of Generative AI: No part of this article was supported by any AI.

REFERENCES

- Batra, J. (2017). Politico-literary response to terrorism: a study of Arundhati Roy's the ministry of utmost happiness. *Humanities and Social Sciences Review*, 7(2), 429-437.
- Bauman, Z., & Times, L. (2007). *Liquid times: Living in an Age of Uncertainty*. Cambridge: Polity Press
- Caulfield, J. (2023, June 22). *Textual Analysis | Guide, 3 approaches & Examples*. Scribbr. <https://www.scribbr.com/methodology/textual-analysis/>
- Gabriel, Y. (2012). The Other and Othering: A Short Introduction. *Yiannis Gabriel Stories*. <http://www.yiannisgabriel.com/2012/09/the-other-and-othering-short.html>
- Ganguly, S. (2017). Arundhati Roy, the Ministry of Utmost Happiness. *Asiatic: IIUM Journal of English Language and Literature*, 11(2), 133-137. <https://doi.org/10.31436/asiatic.v11i2.1087>
- Ghoshal, S. (2017). The Ministry of Utmost Happiness by Arundhati Roy.A. *The Huffington Post India*.
- Khan, M. S. (2017). *Truth has a habit to prevail. Greater Kashmir*. <https://www.greaterkashmir.com/news/opinion/truth-has-ahabit-to-prevail/>
- Lacan, J.(1998). *The Seminar of Jacques Lacan: The Four Fundamental Concepts of Psychoanalysis*. MILLER J.A (ED). WW Norton & Company. (Original work published 1988)

- Levinas, E. (1979). *Totality and infinity: An essay on exteriority* (Vol. 1). Springer Science & Business Media.
- Levi-Strauss, C. (1992). *Tristes Tropiques*. Penguin Books.
- Lune, H., & Berg, B. L. (2017). *Qualitative research methods for the social sciences*. Pearson Education Limited
- Rorty, R. (1998). Human rights, rationality, and sentimentality. *Headline Series*, (318), 116.
- Roy, A. (2017). *The Ministry of Utmost Happiness: A Novel*. Vintage.
- Said, E. (1978). *Orientalism: Western concepts of the Orient*. New York: Pantheon.
- Said, E. W. (1994). Identity, authority, and freedom: The potentate and the traveler. *Boundary* 2, 21(3), 1- 18. <https://doi.org/10.2307/303599>
- Sehgal, P. (2017). Arundhati Roy's fascinating mess. *The Atlantic*, 320, 36-38.
- Spivak, G. C. (1985). The Rani of Sirmur: An essay in reading the archives. *History and theory*, 24(3), 247-272.
- Stanley, L. (Ed). (2013). *Feminist Praxis (Rle Feminist Theory): Research, Theory And Epistemology In Feminist Sociology*. Routledge.
- Thibierge, S., & Morin, C. (2010). The self and the subject: A psychoanalytic Lacanian perspective. *Neuropsychoanalysis*, 12(1), 81-93.

Publisher's Note: All claims expressed in this article are solely those of the authors and do not necessarily represent those of their affiliated organizations or the publisher, the editors and the reviewers. Any product that may be evaluated in this article, or claim made by its manufacturer, is not guaranteed or endorsed by the publisher.